1	NEW YORK STATE SENATE
2	STANDING COMMITTEE ON ELECTIONS
3	
4	Public Hearing in the Matter
5	State's Regulations Law and
6	Regulations Governing Casting a Ballot
7	and Polling Places
8	
9	Syracuse Common Council Chambers
10	233 East Washington Street City Hall - 4th Floor
11	Syracuse, New York
12	May 14, 2009 Thursday 10 a.m.
13	10 a.m.
14	BEFORE: Senator Joseph P. Addabbo, Jr. Chair
15	
16	PRESENT: Senator Joseph Griffo
17	Senator Antoine Thompson
18	Senator David J. Valesky
19	
20	
21	

1	INDEX OF SPEAKERS
2	ED RYAN 8 Democratic Elections Commissioner
3	Onondaga County
4	COMMISSIONER SZCZESNIAK 31
5	PRESTON FAGAN
67	FRANK PANNISI
8	DIANE DWIRE 54 Chairwoman
9	Onondaga Democratic County Committee
10	DUSTIN CZARNY 60 Chairman
11	
	DR. WANDA WARREN BERRY 68 Director
	New Yorkers for Verified Voting
14	DR. GRANT REEHER 78
15	NINA KOHN 85 Associate Professor of Syracuse University
16	College of Law
17	REGINALD NEALE
18	CHARLES PIERCE-EL 95
19	National Action Network
20	LENORE RAPALSKI 101 Director of Advocacy
21	Syracuse League of Women Voters

22	ROBERT SPITZER	104
	Chairman	
23	Political Science Department	
	SUNY - Cortland	
24		

1	RICHARD KENDRICK 108 Director
2	Institute for Civic Engagement SUNY - Cortland
3	SONT - Cortain
4	CAROLYN TODD 117 New Yorkers for Verified Voting
5	MIKE ATKINS 121 Executive Director
6	Concerned Citizens Action Program
7	BISHOP MOLEFE 123
8	
_	WRITTEN STATEMENTS SUBMITTED BY:
9	DOGG CALINI 127
10	ROSS GALIN
11	LYNNE M. JONES 136 LAURA P. COSTELLO
12	Commissioners
12	Madison County Board of Elections
13	CHARLES (Chuckie) HOLSTEIN 143
14	Executive Director of FOCUS
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	

1	PROCEEDINGS
2	SENATOR VALESKY: Okay. I think
3	we'll call this public hearing to order.
4	This is a public hearing of the Senate
5	Standing Committee on Elections. I am not
6	Senator Addabbo, the chair of the committee.
7	He is on his way, his flight has landed and
8	he'll be here momentarily, but we have a
9	number of speakers who wish to present
10	testimony today and so we're going to begin.
11	While I'm not on the committee, I'm the
12	host senator here so I'm delighted to
13	welcome first my colleagues, to my left
14	Senator Antoine Thompson, who's joining us
15	from Buffalo, Senator Joe Griffo, who is
16	joining us from Utica today.
17	When the chairman gets here, I'm sure
18	he'll have some opening comments of his own
19	but I'll very briefly for those who are here
20	and for the record share with you that this
21	is a one in a series of five public hearings

- that are taking place around the state
- 23 involving the issue of reform of our
- election laws, Albany, Syracuse earlier, and

1	later in June, September and November aroun
2	the state.
3	Our task is to consider various pieces
4	of legislation and hear testimony on pieces
5	of legislation regarding reform of the
6	election process and reinvigorating
7	participatory democracy.
8	And I appreciate again my colleagues
9	who are here. I'll note also for the record
10	that Senator Griffo is the former chairman
11	of the election law committee in his first
12	term in the senate, and so I'm delighted to
13	have him here both in that role and as a
14	member of the committee itself.
15	Before we call our witnesses and
16	what we will do is just call them forth to
17	come to the table in front of the dais.
18	We'd ask that you try to keep your remarks,
19	I guess, limited to around five to ten
20	minutes. And we'll have an opportunity for
21	comments. We do have, I think, 15 or 16

- individuals who have signed up to speak so
- 23 try to keep things moving along as quickly
- as possible.

1	And the camera here is an indication
2	that we are web casting this hearing as we
3	are doing with many, if not all, the public
4	hearings. And what is it, nysenate.gov?
5	Anybody know? Nysenate.gov, okay, very
6	good.
7	Opening comments from Senator Thompson?
8	SENATOR THOMPSON: Yes. Let me just
9	say I think this is excellent. I just want
10	to commend you and the committee as well for
11	having this public hearing, in addition, all
12	the folks that have come out.
13	I'm just really impressed about how
14	many people have come out from this region.
15	I think it's great because, you know, the
16	goal here is to make voting easier but also
17	secure and protecting the vote. So I'm
18	really excited.
19	I'm a big voting rights person, and so
20	I'm really glad to be able to just drop in
21	for a few minutes and say that this is an

- awesome turnout and that hopefully we'll
- have some great dialogue and help make
- voting easier but also more secure as well.

1	SENATOR VALESKY: Thank you, Senator
2	Thompson. Senator Griffo?
3	SENATOR GRIFFO: Thank you, everyone,
4	for being here today. Share also the fact
5	that it's so important to have many of you
6	here to provide your input and to be
7	involved in this process.
8	As we heard, this is so essential to
9	our democracy so we want to make it easier
10	to vote.
11	We also want to make sure that we
12	preserve the integrity of the voting system,
13	so there are a number of pieces of
14	legislation that are being considered and
15	your input will help us make that decision.
16	And I also want to echo what Senator Valesky
17	said, that if you come up I know that
18	you'll be filing testimony if you can
19	summarize your statements and give us an
20	opportunity to interact would be more than
21	I think that is something that would be

- beneficial for all of us involved.
- So thank you for being here.
- 24 SENATOR VALESKY: Thank you, Senator.

1	First we'll hear from Ed Ryan, the
2	elections commissioner, democratic elections
3	commissioner here in Onondaga County. Ed.
4	COMMISSIONER RYAN: Do you want
5	copies of this?
6	SENATOR VALESKY: Please. Tom, if
7	you want to collect them.
8	COMMISSIONER RYAN: Right or left?
9	SENATOR VALESKY: Whichever you
10	prefer, Commissioner.
11	ED RYAN
12	Democratic Elections Commissioner
13	COMMISSIONER RYAN: Thank you. Well,
14	I want to thank you for inviting us here.
15	And I respect your ability to ask these
16	people what they're thinking because you're
17	going to get a wide variety of opinions here
18	on this.
19	And I come at it from a couple areas
20	because I was a former legislator and I know
21	the obviously, what we do at the

- legislature, money is a key issue and
- obviously we have significant problem there.
- So some of these things are going to impact

1	the budget at the county level. And we have
2	a wonderful legislature that has been very
3	helpful to us to do what we need to get done
4	and they've been very supportive. But we're
5	getting to the point now where they're
6	looking at some numbers, and we need to make
7	sure that they give us the dollars we need
8	to support some of the things that are
9	coming down.
10	So what I'd like to do is start and I'd
11	like a little comment. I started looking at
12	this and my remarks with Helen Higgins are
13	based on these one-liners, so, if I
14	interpreted the resolution incorrectly, stop
15	me, because we did it on, you know, one
16	sentence and not reading the full bill. I'm
17	not sure what the impact of the full bill
18	is.
19	So we'll go with early voting. We'll
20	start with that one. This would create a
21	need for additional personnel. Our staff is

- on overtime at this period between printing
- poll books, creating and test-ecting,
- setting up the polling places and

1	ine-tuning 2,000 inspectors, many of who at
2	the last minute will tell us they can't
3	work.
4	With 65 different ballot codes this
5	year, it must be handled with extreme care
6	for someone handing out a ballot code at the
7	Board of Elections, knowing the right one to
8	give these people.
9	In my view, this is an unfunded mandate
10	that we would be pressed into, that we will
11	have to hire additional people with
12	experience to do this, because this could
13	get expensive and we absolutely want to make
14	sure that we have the right ballot code in
15	the right voter's hands. And that's a big
16	concern to us.
17	The no-excuse absentee, it takes
18	approximately five minutes for our staff to
19	process an absentee voter start to finish,
20	between the time they call in, when we mail
21	things out and we bring it back. We had

- 22 13,142 absentee ballots last year, and we
- sent out 15,653 ballots that had been sent
- out. Our costs per ballot was about \$3.26

1	per voter. To process a regular absentee
2	voter in a presidential year, we now have
3	spent over \$3 million to accommodate all
4	voters with a new voting system, and now you
5	are going to another direction which will
6	incur additional cost on our part.
7	As a county representative, it's
8	another expense I've got to go to our
9	legislature and ask them to bear this on the
10	tax, on the property tax. This could be a
11	problem.
12	Now, Oregon has absentee ballots. You
13	know, if we went all that way, well, then
14	that would make sense. Just send a ballot
15	out to every voter and have them mail it
16	back. That probably would be the easiest.
17	But when we have two and three and four
18	different ways to vote here, mistakes get
19	made, ballots get handed out the wrong way
20	and the personnel that we have running it
21	gets very hairy trying to get all this done

- when you've got four different directions to
- vote.
- The next one is the affidavit ballot.

1	if a voter is allowed to vote at any poil
2	site, they would be well be voting for
3	candidates who will not be representing
4	them. If I read this correctly, that you're
5	asking that and this is the one I'm very
6	unsure of. The way I read it is if you want
7	to go to a polling site in your county, that
8	you can just go to that polling site and
9	vote, whether it's your particular voting
10	district or not. And I may have
11	misinterpreted that, but that's the way I
12	interpreted it.
13	If that's the case, you know, we try to
14	get all the voters in their voting
15	particular district because we want them
16	voting for the right candidate. Say two
17	state senators split the county down Main
18	Street. You know, one senator has an
19	opponent, the other one doesn't. Friends
20	and family of the other one slide over to
21	the other affidavit, vote over on the other

- side for people who aren't going to
- represent them, and then we have to ferret
- out whether or not they're in the right

1	polling place or voting for the right
2	representative there.
3	So that should be a concern if that's
4	the way we interpret this, that if you can
5	vote an affidavit ballot anywhere in the
6	county, we're going to spend a lot of time
7	making sure that the people they voted for
8	are, in fact, the people that represented
9	them if they live over on the other side of
10	the street. I don't know how we're going to
11	manage that in a timely fashion.
12	The next one, 1058, we spend a great
13	deal of time right now making sure
14	everything is accessible, and we have made
15	permanent adjustments to polling places and
16	temporary fixes to polling places to make
17	them adjustable.
18	We have a team of two people out
19	looking at all these sites, revisiting them,
20	because this year with the new ballots and
21	we're trying to do a Pilot Plan A, some of

- these areas don't have enough room because
- 23 we have to have tables, private polling --
- or voting booths.

1	So we're trying to accommodate everyone
2	with the spaces that are available, and I
3	think all of you are aware that getting
4	accessible polling places for 16 hours in a
5	particular day in particular areas are
6	difficult especially in the city where a lot
7	of the older places are not handicap
8	accessible. But we've been doing that, and
9	we've eliminated the ones that are not
10	handicapped accessible.
11	Split shift, this very well could work.
12	What we run the risk of not having enough
13	inspectors. Right now we train about 2,500
14	inspectors and we hope to have 1,800 to
15	2,000 at the end of the day after some of
16	them go through the process and quit before
17	they get there.
18	We could also have a problem with
19	mistakes because if you had a group coming
20	in at 6:00 a.m. and leaving at 2:00 and then
21	another group coming at 2:00 to 9:00, what

- do we do if the group coming in in the
- afternoon chooses not to come in. Then
- we're forcing that person who is expecting

1	to be there	a half a da	y to stay.	That's
---	-------------	-------------	------------	--------

2 something that has to be thought through so

- 3 it's a workable situation.
- 4 SENATOR VALESKY: We'll just pause
- 5 for just a moment. Thank you.
- 6 COMMISSIONER RYAN: Good idea.
- 7 SENATOR VALESKY: Chairman Addabbo is
- 8 here, Senator Joe Addabbo, who is chairman
- 9 of the Senate Elections Committee. Welcome,
- 10 Chairman.
- 11 COMMISSIONER RYAN: Do you want me to
- start again?
- 13 SENATOR VALESKY: Actually, we're
- 14 okay; right?
- 15 COMMISSIONER RYAN: You can read?
- Okay, good. All right.
- 17 So, I mean, the idea of a split shift,
- it could possibly work, but there's got to
- be some caveats on there because we have
- 20 trouble right now in certain areas getting
- 21 enough democratic inspectors in certain

- areas getting republican inspectors, and,
- 23 unless we get younger people in here and
- 24 more people involved in it, then this isn't

1	going to work. And we struggle every year
2	to get quality inspectors, especially when
3	we go to the new machine and you're talking
4	about affidavits, handing out the right
5	ballot code.
6	We have 65 ballot codes this year, and,
7	if you have inept inspectors and they're
8	handing out wrong ballot codes to people,
9	we're in for a lot of problems. So getting
10	2,000 qualified people to be inspectors and
11	now going to 4,000 is a yeoman's task in
12	order for that to be done and done properly.
13	There is the voting in the proper
14	place. You've asked here on 2443 that the
15	poll worker can instruct people to go to the
16	right polling place. We have 204 polling
17	places, we have 459 polling districts, and
18	we have people that you're asking to tell
19	them where their polling place is in another
20	town or even on the other side of the
21	county. It would be absolutely impossible

- for us to arm the 2,000 polling inspectors
- with all the maps and polling districts to
- tell these people exactly where they're

1	going to go. People get confused we when
2	you have polling places that are split by
3	the middle of the street much less five or
4	six towns away.
5	There is a software system out there
6	for it. It's called Ask Ed. And it does
7	work. It would cost us \$45,000 to purchase,
8	and obviously there's updates on that 'cause
9	it's a software system. And I'm not sure we
10	have the ability to get that through our
11	county legislature to get enough of these
12	hand-held devices to tell them how to get
13	there. It's \$45,000 first year and then all
14	the upgrades on it. So, again, like
15	everything else in town, it comes down to
16	money. We'd like to do it all, but yet how
17	much do we do it.
18	The form of a paper ballot, absolutely
19	agree. If there's anything on any of these
20	things you should do, this is the absolute
21	first one you should do. Having someone go

- into a polling booth and bullet vote for
- somebody or vote for half the people 'cause
- they don't know the people down the end and

1	have that paper come back to them because
2	the machine is spitting it back 'cause
3	they've undervoted, if they check this box,
4	it goes through, it will save a lot of
5	frustration. So we agree that should go.
6	And if you have any other questions,
7	I'd be happy to answer them.
8	SENATOR ADDABBO: First, Mr. Ryan, l
9	want to thank you very much for being here
10	and again participating in these hearings
11	we're taking throughout the state. And
12	certainly we are mindful that the elections
13	committee, as it turns out legislation, that
14	this legislation does have an impact on the
15	Board of Elections throughout the state, and
16	we want to be mindful of that because
17	obviously we need to work together as we
18	implement these pieces of legislation.
19	One thing we don't want to do is do
20	legislation that's going to put an undue
21	burden on the workers of the Board of

- Elections, which again I've said at all
- these public hearings, the Board of
- Elections workers work throughout the year,

1	not just on an elections year or just on
2	Election Day; we work throughout the year.
3	And I appreciate the workers that you have
4	at the Board of Elections.
5	So we have to be mindful of that. You
6	know, we want to work with the board
7	elections to make sure that when we do a
8	piece of legislation that there are not
9	unfunded mandates, that they work very well
10	with the Board of Elections. And so we hope
11	to increase the amount of communication with
12	the Board of Elections throughout the state,
13	so again I appreciate your input here.
14	Certainly this opens a door. Obviously
15	the communications don't have to be said at
16	a public hearing. They should be whenever
17	you feel that the elections committee should
18	take up an item, should take up an issue or
19	address an issue or currently is addressing
20	an issue that is of concern to you. So I
21	please welcome your input as well.

- Do any of my colleagues have questions?
- 23 Senator Griffo.
- 24 SENATOR GRIFFO: Hi, Commissioner,

1	how you are?
2	SENATOR ADDABBO: Wonderful. How are
3	you?
4	SENATOR GRIFFO: Good. As a former
5	county official, I totally understand some
6	of the concerns that you've expressed, and I
7	think actually that you all have to play an
8	important role in any of the legislation
9	that is developed and as it evolves because
10	your input is very valuable and it's
11	important to understand the impact it would
12	have on the actual operations and costs
13	associated with the conduct of elections.
14	The last thing you talked about with
15	the undervote, I want to make sure I just
16	understood. You said you thought that
17	should be a priority. At the last hearing,
18	some people expressed some concerns about
19	additional lines and singling out people who
20	may have not voted. Then they would know
21	that some of these people may have voted

- intentionally not to -- for a particular
- race may have purposely not voted. So
- you're not indicating that we should force

1	them to vote in every race, are you, if
2	their choice is not to?
3	COMMISSIONER RYAN: Absolutely not
4	You know, there's probably 30 percent of the
5	people that don't vote the whole ballot, you
6	know, because they don't know names and
7	they're there for a few. If I'm
8	understanding the resolution correctly, is
9	if you want to vote for three people out of
10	ten, you know, there are ten races, you're
11	checking and say I understand I've
12	undervoted on this ballot but that is in
13	fact all the people I want to vote for, so
14	the machine will accept it rather than send
15	it back to them and then they got to push
16	more buttons to say I understand it and send
17	it through.
18	We're talking about a lot of people who
19	are not computer savvy that are going to be
20	frustrated when that comes back to them and
21	now they're going to feel, okay, now that

- somebody's watching me, I've got to go back
- and vote for these people even though I
- don't want to. This is a training exercise

1	for a lot of people that is going to be
2	difficult for some of the seniors to get
3	involved with once they hit that machine and
4	try to it keeps spitting it back to them
5	'cause they didn't do something right.
6	The other you know, just as an
7	aside, you know, we're all running out this
8	pilot program, we're all trying to get this
9	done right, and I think this is one thing
10	that I think is scaring the hell out of a
11	lot of us here is and I just talked to
12	the voter for verification over here is
13	if you go to a hundred percent man counting,
14	and I wanted to just to leave these numbers
15	with you. We're going to try to do three
16	towns that have a single ballot code,
17	because that would be easy just in case
18	we're forced to do a hand count. We have 65
19	ballot codes in Onondaga County this year,
20	so that's 65 different ballots that went to
21	make sure get in the right hands of the

- right people.
- We had our two deputies take a look at
- 24 -- two years ago they pulled out a hundred

1	absentee ballots and hand counted them, and
2	I want to leave you these numbers 'cause
3	this is money. This is money. If you and I
4	were running against each other, it would
5	take about three minutes to count the
6	hundred ballots. If it was two out of the
7	four of us, it would take 15 minutes. If it
8	was three out of six of us, it took 45
9	minutes. And if it was four out of eight,
10	it took an hour and 20 minutes to make sure
11	every vote was counted in the right place
12	and they actually had the votes between
13	them. So on that particular ballot, which
14	was, you know, unusual 'cause we had best
15	out of two, best of three, best out of four,
16	it took two hours and 20 minutes to count a
17	hundred ballots, and that's two people.
18	Now, last election, there was only
19	there was twice as many ballots, but they
20	were all single. That would be a lot
21	simpler. So the idea of it and the

- practicality of how it works you have to
- 23 understand. So, if we got two hours and 20
- 24 minutes by two people and we have 110,000

1	ballots, that's a lot of time and a lot of
2	dollars on the backs here, so there's got to
3	be a better way to double-check this.
4	You've got to put something in Face Book
5	about it too. It's got to be a close race,
6	it's got to be something, because again,
7	we are blessed here in Onondaga County
8	because our legislature has been more than
9	adequate funding what we need to do, what we
10	need to do. Some of the smaller counties
11	that you'll hear from, they're struggling to
12	keep up right now without anything else. So
13	I don't speak about us so much; it's some of
14	our neighboring counties are going to have a
15	very, very difficult time funding some of
16	these things 'cause they don't have the
17	resources to do what they're supposed to do
18	now.
19	SENATOR ADDABBO: Commissioner Ryan
20	one last quick question. Briefly, can you
21	state how much the Onondaga County Board of

- Elections budget is currently and how that
- compares to last year's budget, up or down?
- 24 COMMISSIONER RYAN: Well, we're up a

1	couple hundred thousand dollars, and we put
2	that in there because if we went to Complete
3	Plan A and our budget's about \$3.3
4	million. If we went to Plan A, which means
5	we would have to, under the new rules, make
6	330,000 ballots, because we have about
7	287,000 voters and you're supposed to make
8	110 percent ballots, even we know in an off
9	election year we are only going to have 35
10	percent of the people voting. So we are
11	predicate we're looking to see how do we
12	get a local printer or some printer that can
13	make them as we need them, 'cause last year
14	well, we put in a couple hundred thousand
15	dollars, to answer your question, that we
16	may not use. But if they make us use Plan
17	A, then we have to go out and print these
18	ballots that are costing about \$200,000.
19	And that's we're not expecting to use it,
20	but if a judge tells us we have to use it
21	it's there.

- So that's in there.
- 23 SENATOR VALESKY: Commissioner, just
- one question. In regard to the first bill

1	that's been proposed and for which we're
2	seeking comment in regard to early voting
3	and I imagine a number of our speakers to
4	come, as they continue, will address the
5	issue, particularly perhaps Professor Reeher
6	and Professor Spitzer, can talk about
7	national trends my understanding is 32
8	other states now have gone to a system of
9	early voting for all sorts of reasons.
10	I hear your concern in regard to the
11	fiscal issue and I sympathize with those
12	concerns, but, leaving those concerns aside,
13	from the perspective of the Board of
14	Elections do you have any opinion in regard
15	to a movement toward early voting as many
16	other states have done? If again leaving
17	aside the fiscal concerns that you obviously
18	have.
19	COMMISSIONER RYAN: Well, allowing
20	people to vote obviously is what we need to
21	do. We need to get I mean think about

- it. You go to some other countries, they
- stand in line for an hour and a half, they
- 24 walk two hours, people -- where America says

1	T want it and I want it now and I don't
2	want to wait five minutes for it,' you know,
3	and anything can be done as long as you can
4	afford to do it. And that's there is the
5	problem. We would have to hire a couple of
6	people that are honed in and know, when I
7	give you this ballot, it's the right one, I
8	just didn't grab it and give you a ballot
9	and you're voting for somebody that's not
10	going to represent you.
11	And you're going to get your busy times
12	and slow times, and I don't know what time
13	period you got but, you know, last year we
14	were working for three and a half weeks
15	twelve hours a day Monday through Friday and
16	ten hours on Saturday, and we didn't have
17	early voting. Now we have early voting.
18	That could bring in another 5 or 6,000
19	people that we have to take care of in a
20	timely fashion and space to do it in.
21	So, all those things. We're running

- around like chickens, you know, trying to
- get this done...you know, can be done --
- 24 anything can be done, but we'll need the

1	bodies to do it.
2	SENATOR VALESKY: Thank you.
3	SENATOR ADDABBO: Commissioner, again
4	thank very much for your time. Just one
5	thing, I look forward to continuing a
6	conversation with you on these bills.
7	COMMISSIONER RYAN: Good.
8	SENATOR ADDABBO: So thank you very
9	much, Commissioner.
10	Our next individual to give testimony,
11	Edward Szczesniak, former elections
12	commissioner of Onondaga County Board of
13	Elections.
14	While Mr. Szczesniak is coming here,
15	let me first formally say thank you for
16	being here. And it's a pleasure being here
17	in Syracuse. What this committee is doing
18	is going throughout the state having these
19	public hearings on issues that are coming
20	through the elections committee on ideas
21	that we hope to work in the future on. So,

- again, it is a pleasure to be here.
- 23 Let me just do a little housekeeping.
- I want to thank all staff who has helped put

1	tins together, everyone for being here and
2	working on this. It's a pleasure being in
3	Senator David Valesky's district, so again,
4	Senator Valesky, thank you very much and
5	your staff as well.
6	Senator Griffo, good to see you again
7	and thank you for being here as well. I
8	want to thank Baye Muhammad, who helped also
9	put this together. Again I'd like to thank
10	him.
11	To my far right, David Kogelman is the
12	legal counsel for the elections committee,
13	and again I want to thank David for his help
14	on this hearing as well as Bernadette Oliver
15	from my office for putting this together.
16	In short, ladies and gentlemen, you
17	know, whether we talk about, you know,
18	voters in my district from the southwest,
19	Queens and New York City, or whether we talk
20	about voters here in Syracuse, the concerns

are the same. It is one New York, and we

- are looking to basically look at the process
- of voting from registration all the way up
- 24 and to the actual voting process, trying to

1	make it easier and facilitate the process
2	for all qualified voters. So that is the
3	idea that we have here.
4	We are dealing with that in terms 32 of
5	legislation and administrative decisions
6	that have to be made, and so, therefore,
7	your input is rather important. So again I
8	appreciate your time and participation here
9	today at this hearing.
10	I'm going to ask now from here on
11	future speakers to try and keep their
12	comments to roughly three minutes if we
13	could. We don't have a buzzer or any type
14	of electric shock treatment going on here to
15	stop people from talking three minutes, but,
16	in order to give the listand we have a
17	pretty extensive list of speakersto give
18	everybody the opportunity to speak and time
19	for questions and answers, I'm going to ask,
20	even if you have written testimony, if you

can briefly summarize it to an extent and

- keep your comments to roughly about three
- 23 minutes so that we can get through the whole
- list while our time is here.

1	So again, welcome, Commissioner
2	Szczesniak, a pleasure, and thank you for
3	your testimony.
4	COMMISSIONER SZCZESNIAK
5	COMMISSIONER SZCZESNIAK: Senators
6	Mr. ChairmanI don't know what to you call
7	you, Senator Valesky.
8	SENATOR VALESKY: Friend.
9	COMMISSIONER SZCZESNIAK: Friend,
10	there you go.
11	I want to thank you all for the
12	opportunity to share my thoughts on some of
13	this proposed election law reform. And I am
14	following Eddy. I'm an election
15	commissioner light, I guess you could say at
16	this point in time.
17	What I'd like to do, that I'll try to
18	briefly touch on, the various acts as was
19	presented with a few thoughts in mind on
20	each of them, the first one being the Early
21	Voting Act.

- To me, the fact that early voting would
- 23 make participation easier for citizens who
- cannot make it to the poles on Election Day

1	is obviously a positive thing. However, I
2	believe this is better addressed by allowing
3	these voters to use the absentee ballot
4	process without the current restrictions on
5	accessibility to absentee ballots as is
6	addressed by another of the resolutions.
7	Election Day breakdowns are adequately
8	addressed, I believe, with the affidavit
9	ballots.
10	We're in the four-year cycle, and even,
11	however, in the years of presidential
12	elections when we may get 78 percent turnout
13	here in Onondaga County, very seldom are
14	there significant waiting times to vote.
15	The issue of a person in one centralized
16	location also would not be a convenient
17	piece of countywide voters for countywide
18	voters.
19	Registration and voting data would have
20	to be made available at the centralized
21	site, and that's why you almost need the

- centralized site.
- You should also be aware that many
- village and other elections are not

1	currently conducted by the County Board of
2	Elections, so they have an outlying town
3	asking those folks, who happen to be having
4	say, a primary election, to come out and
5	vote at the centralized here in the
6	center of Syracuse is truly not a convenient
7	opportunity for these folks.
8	And then, of course, there would be a
9	need to have a tracking system created so
10	people don't vote early and then, of course,
11	again at their regular polling place.
12	I guess what I'm really saying about
13	that particular bill is I think there's a
14	better way to bite the apple, and also
15	there's more fiscal implications than just
16	printing more absentee ballots. Like to
17	just stress that.
18	In terms of Senate Bill 5028, the
19	absentee voting constitutional amendment,
20	that is something that election
21	commissioners across the state have been

- lobbying for umpteen years, and so I think
- that would be a major asset. Of course,
- it's the difficult hurdle of changing the

1	constitution that presents its real problem.
2	In terms of Senate Bill 2868, absentee
3	voting election law amendment, that's just
4	changing election law, I agree with a
5	hundred percent with the justification that
6	was presented with the bill.
7	In terms of Senate Bill 1701, counting
8	of affidavit ballots, this I have difficulty
9	agreeing with. Administrative error on the
10	part of inspectors, I agree, should not be a
11	basis not to count a vote. On the other
12	hand, federal as well as New York State case
13	law is dictating otherwise saying that a
14	voter must be in the correct polling place
15	to be able to count that affidavit ballot.
16	The other considerations really are
17	inspectors could be required to determine if
18	the voter is in the current correct polling
19	place. But, as Eddy already testified, once
20	you get beyond your own location and you
21	start expanding as to where a voter should

- vote throughout the county, very, very
- 23 difficult thing to do.
- 24 And probably the most critical piece

1	and why I suspect that the courts have ruled
2	that you have to be in a correct polling
3	place is that that's the ballot you have.
4	The other polling place, you're going to
5	have different versions of the ballot, and
6	if somebody even within here, say, the City
7	of Syracuse comes in and they're on the east
8	side of the city in a particular county
9	legislative district and they're in the
10	wrong place but even though they're
11	currently an active voter, a registered
12	voter, their county legislators are in a
13	total different contest and they're not
14	going to have that ballot at that location
15	as well; so they may vote on that ballot,
16	sometimes forgetting who the candidates are
17	for their real ballot and think they've
18	walked away voting in a proper vote, and
19	they really haven't voted for anybody.
20	Requirement for a Senate Bill 1058,
21	requirement for all polling places to be

- accessible to physically disabled voters,
- obviously the federal law requires that,
- 24 mandates that. To me, the issue truly is

1	understanding what accessible means. Board
2	of elections are not experts in evaluating
3	accessibility standards. These may be
4	better evaluated by building code
5	enforcement officers who deal with that type
6	of activity on a regular basis.
7	Also, boards of elections use polling
8	places normally only two or three times a
9	year. Many of these are government and
10	school facilities that are federally
11	mandated to meet these same accessibility
12	standards year-round but don't. They use
13	as in some educational locations, they use a
14	their own equivalent of a waiver by
15	saying that 'Oh, we have all our disabled
16	students go to just one of our ten school
17	locations, therefore we make sure that one
18	is' 'accessiblity is there,' but the
19	other ones don't have it. Yet when it comes
20	to voting, everybody has to have it.
21	So it seemed more appropriate just to

- enforce the standards across the board for
- all the public facilities that we normally
- use as polling places that are there all

1	year-round.
2	Finally, the commitment of time for
3	training, conducting site evaluations,
4	ensuring adjustments are made to ensure
5	accessibility, purchasing and distributing
6	the temporary items such as ramps and then
7	documenting all these changes, all these
8	surveys, et cetera, and paying for many of
9	these adjustments far exceed what's in the
10	bill, limited local fiscal implications, so
11	there are some real dollars involved in
12	doing that type of accessibility.
13	Senate Bill 5112, voting in the proper
14	polling place, again the concept is fine;
15	however, requiring poll inspectors to be
16	prepared to consult a map, street-finder, et
17	cetera, for all election districts, for all
18	polling places in the county is a major
19	challenge. Remember, poll inspectors work
20	one or two days a year in this role. Their
21	pay is more geared toward being a volunteer

- than an election law and countywide
- 23 geography expert. Polling places change
- every year. A lot of misinformation can be

1 given by ill-informed part-time inspectors. 2 I know we have all good inspectors and 3 some are even a little better than others, 4 but they are part time and they're not 5 necessarily compensated to a degree that 6 would warrant them becoming the experts that 7 we'd like them to be. 8 It's better to have the voter call the 9 Board of Elections, as we do now, by giving 10 them this like white little card that we've 11 been doing for years; they call the board 12 and we tell them proper place to go to. And 13 overall that's been a pretty good system. 14 Sometimes we get backed up with those type 15 of calls 'cause we only got 30, 40 lines out 16 on a particular Election Day to be able to 17 respond to those type of calls, but at least 18 they're the getting the correct information, 19 they go to the right polling place, they'll 20 have the correct ballot for them to be able 21 to complete.

- The last item was Bill 5112 and, that
- goes to the form of paper ballots. And
- there's an interpretation of what was meant

1	by somebody checking off either at the
2	beginning of the ballot to say, A, I know
3	I'm going to undervote, or if it was I
4	don't know where it was going, but it was
5	just an added requirement and they were
6	still going to have the machine kick out
7	each time they undervoted to me is just
8	superfluous and probably a time- consuming
9	thing that didn't need to be.
10	I think that's the last specific thing
11	that I had. The one thing I would just make
12	as a general observation, a lot of what we
13	talk about in this type of bill has to do
14	with people, and there's no system that's a
15	perfect system, no matter whether we're
16	looking at various voting systems or as
17	we're dealing with these various issues
18	we're talking about this morning. It's the
19	people, in this case, the representatives of
20	the boards of elections, are those
21	inspectors out for all those different

- polling places. And too many times we think
- in terms just as an extension of staff, and
- so they're very qualified, very well-trained

1	and everything else. And in reality, it is.
2	Two or three times a year they're just doing
3	this, and, as much as they want to do it
4	well, remembering from year to year, even
5	what the updated watchings have been have
6	become a challenge for them as well.
7	So those are the things. I guess maybe
8	one last thing I would say, and this came up
9	when I was with the elections assistance
10	commission group at the federal level, that
11	some of this seems to go to another trend
12	that I heard about in different states where
13	they're doing super election districts,
14	really trying to combine wider geography,
15	wider geographic areas into one location.
16	And that just seems to go against or is
17	contrary to what has been the thrust here in
18	New York State, to make elections convenient
19	as much as possible to the voters. And in
20	the Upstate counties in particular, the time
21	distances can be substantial as opposed to

- New York City where you may have
- congressional districts in five blocks or
- something like that. And so it's just a

1	different world in terms of time/distance,
2	so convenience is a relative factor.
3	And I would end my specific comments
4	that way unless there's some questions.
5	SENATOR ADDABBO: Commissioner
6	Szczesniak, thank you very much. One quick
7	question I have for you and if you answer
8	briefly I would appreciate it.
9	Earlier on you mentioned early voting
10	and then you spoke about absentee ballots.
11	There is a piece of legislation proposed
12	that says we would like to remove the
13	reasoning for absentee ballots thus creating
14	a situation where more absentee ballots may
15	be available to voters. Do you have any
16	objection to that if you say that you'd
17	rather see absentee ballots instead of early
18	voting?
19	COMMISSIONER SZCZESNIAK: Yes, that's
20	what I mentioned early on. I felt the
21	justification was there. I'm supportive of

- that. They have limited inhibitions, if you
- will, on why people should be able to use an
- absentee. And I know there's some of the

1	election	iaw stui	i you're	correcting	in some

- 2 of this, if something goes to the state
- 3 constitution, and that's just a bigger
- 4 challenge to get to but I think we ought to
- 5 take the challenge and just make it more
- 6 accessible.
- 7 SENATOR ADDABBO: Thank you very
- 8 much. Any questions?
- 9 SENATOR VALESKY: One quick question.
- 10 SENATOR ADDABBO: Sure, Senator
- 11 Valesky.
- 12 SENATOR VALESKY: Ed, thank you for
- 13 your testimony. One bill that has been
- introduced as part of this packet and I'm
- not sure if you addressed it or not, Senator
- 16 Klein has introduced a bill that would allow
- 17 local boards of elections to utilize
- elections inspectors for half-day shifts. I
- imagine in your many years of experience you
- would say that it's been getting more and
- 21 more difficult to have election inspectors.

- Would half-day shifts help the situation?
- Would it make it even more difficult, in
- 24 effect, perhaps have doubled the number of

1	inspectors necessary?
2	COMMISSIONER SZCZESNIAK: My thoughts
3	on that go to the following. I think there
4	are times when it would have been very
5	beneficial to have the law allow us to have
6	half-day shifts. I think we would still
7	prefer to try to get people that are willing
8	to be there the whole day, but, whether it's
9	just a challenge of getting adequate numbers
10	of folks or whatever the reason to have
11	half-day shifts, could be a doable a
12	project.
13	I think the issue thereand Eddy
14	tried to address it a little bitis there
15	are some consequences when you're going to
16	change, especially if you did everybody. If
17	everybody worked from 6:00 a.m. to, say,
18	1:00 and then a second shift came in, you
19	lack the continuity of what happened at the
20	beginning of the day versus the end of the
21	day. Part of what we're doing normally with

- the inspectors is saying: We want you to
- check those machines, make sure everything
- 24 was zeroed out, everything was correct.

1	And so, anything that happens during
2	the day, you're going to have been there and
3	seen. At the end of the day, you're going
4	to verify that those are the numbers that
5	voted, et cetera. When you break at midday,
6	you're going to have different folks. They
7	don't know what happened earlier in the
8	morning. And whether that's going to be a
9	critical element or not, I think it could be
10	at some particular times.
11	Particularly as we go to a lot of even
12	the absentees, et cetera, another issue but
13	as we get to close elections, all of a
14	sudden everybody wants to dot the I's and
15	cross the T's, that becomes much more
16	critical having had somebody there all day
17	long that watched the whole process and with
18	credibility say: Nothing went wrong over
19	here, I know the problems we had on the
20	machines, that's why we had so many
21	affidavit ballots, there shouldn't be any

- more, shouldn't be any less.
- 23 SENATOR VALESKY: Thank you.
- SENATOR ADDABBO: Commissioner, thank

1	you very much. Again thank you for your
2	time and testimony.
3	COMMISSIONER SZCZESNIAK: Thank you.
4	SENATOR ADDABBO: We're going to
5	start calling individuals in teams of two.
6	They can be unrelated to their testimony,
7	but again it's just a two-person panel. So
8	the next two are Preston Fagan, president of
9	the NAACP of Syracuse, and Frank Pannisi,
10	South Tier Independence Center.
11	PRESTON FAGAN
12	President of NAACP of Syracuse
13	MR. FAGAN: I want to say thank you,
14	Mr. Chairman. My name is Preston Fagan. I
15	am the president of the Syracuse Onondaga
16	County NAACP. On behalf of our officers,
17	executive committee, membership,
18	constituents and colleagues, I want to thank
19	the committee for the opportunity to address
20	one of the important issues that are of the
21	utmost concern in election reform.

- 22 I'm going to speak regarding Senate
- Bill 2443. As you may know, in Syracuse
- 24 election districts and undoubtedly in other

1	districts across the state, there is an
2	ongoing problem of potential voters arriving
3	to vote at the wrong polling place and
4	finding that they are not registered in the
5	polling book.
6	This is a common problem and one that
7	is traditionally treated in different ways
8	at different districts. For example, if a
9	potential voter is unknown in the district
10	but appears to belong, she or he will
11	usually be a accorded the full courtesy and
12	respect of election inspectors. On the
13	other hand, if that individual appears
14	different in any way, she or he is likely to
15	be treated less courteously and, in some
16	cases, with outright disrespect, often
17	causing an individual to leave the polling
18	place in frustration or anger and give up
19	going to the polls at all.
20	The solution to this is simple,
21	although not necessarily easy from a fiscal

- point of view. To begin with, election
- 23 inspectors should be trained to treat
- everyone with respect, and every polling

1	prace should be spot-checked at spontaneous
2	intervals by the Board of Election observers
3	to be sure that voting policy board
4	policy is carried out.
5	Secondly, a computer with appropriate
6	software listing every polling place in the
7	county should be placed at every polling
8	site so that potential voters can be told
9	not only where their polling site is but can
10	also be given a map printout that shows
11	where they are now with clear-cut directions
12	to the correct site, where they need to go.
13	In this way, election inspectors can
14	perform a positive service for potential
15	voters and may even encourage them to
16	actually go the extra mile to the correct
17	voting place and vote.
18	Perhaps the state could fund this
19	initiative by using stimulus monies to
20	provide the computers, software and
21	training. The state could also develop a

- prototype to track voter participation in a
- 23 longitudinal study conducted over a short
- term or midterm to determine the success of

1	this extra effort by election officials to
2	increase voter participation.
3	The simplicity of this strategy is that
4	only one computer needs to be available at
5	each site, even if more than one district is
6	housed at the facility, since voters can be
7	assisted on a first-come first-served basis,
8	and the actual assistance given should take
9	a minimum of time and effort if inspectors
10	are properly trained in the use of the
11	software.
12	That is the end of my testimony for
13	today, and I thank you for allowing me.
14	SENATOR ADDABBO: Thank you, Mr.
15	Fagan. Thank you.
16	Mr. Pannisi.
17	FRANK PANNISI
18	Southern Tier
19	Independence Center in Binghamton
20	MR. PANNISI: Yes. I'm Frank
21	Pannisi. I'm from the Southern Tier

- Independence Center in Binghamton, New York.
- We work with people with disabilities. I'm
- 24 here today largely to recommend quick

1	passage of 1058 and 1386. 1058, which would
2	make polling places accessible, we have been
3	trying to get such a bill passed for more
4	years than I can count.
5	A lot of people with disabilities have
6	not been full participants in the election
7	process because, number one, they couldn't
8	get into the polling place; number two, if
9	they could get in, they couldn't use the old
10	lever machines. Now we've got the
11	accessible machines, but there's still too
12	many sites that are inaccessible so the
13	person who needs to use the machine can't
14	get in to use it.
15	I've been working on this issue for 25
16	years. I started in my home county in
17	Broome in 1984. I campaign to make all
18	polling places accessible. We did it. We
19	were the first county in the state to do it,
20	but it took six years. And what finally
21	pushed it over the edge was in 1990 my

- county board refused to grant any waivers.
- Four polling sites were moved very quickly;
- two were modified. I mean we're talking a

1	three-inch step and a six-inch step.
2	So it wasn't a big deal, but the
3	refusal to grant waivers is what finally did
4	it. The waiver process is what is standing
5	in the way of accessibility throughout the
6	state.
7	I'm one of the lucky ones. I've got
8	incredibly cooperative county boards of
9	elections throughout the years. I've talked
10	to my colleagues around the state and I hear
11	their county is 10 percent accessible or 5
12	percent accessible or even 3 percent
13	accessible, and I've heard of waivers being
14	granted in the 1980's and '90's that are
15	still considered to be viable today even
16	though they're supposed to be reapplied for
17	every year.
18	So the waiver is a problem. It's been
19	misused, it's been abused, over the years as
20	far as accessibility. Someone earlier had
21	stated that a lot of these buildings are

- supposed to be accessible by state and
- federal law. That is absolutely true. And
- I don't think the onus should be on the

1	Board of Elections to make changes to
2	buildings that are required to be
3	accessible, but a lot of polling places are
4	in churches. Churches are exempt from the
5	Americans with Disabilities Act. Many
6	churches are more interested in
7	accessibility, but the fact is they don't
8	have to be by law and often they can't
9	afford the ramp or widening of the doors or
10	whatever is needed to be done.
11	My county Broome and neighboring Tioga
12	County used HAVA funds to make all their
13	sites accessible for the ones that they
14	did for a lot of churches, a lot of
15	buildings that weren't otherwise required or
16	that it would have been an undue burden for.
17	Another thing, county elections
18	commissioners are not well-versed in
19	accessibility standards, nor should they be
20	expected to be. Having worked closely with
21	these people over the years, it's amazing

- the variety of duties they have and they
- don't need one more thing piled on top of
- them.

1	There are independent living centers
2	throughout the state, there are statewide
3	commissions that have the expertise and
4	access. They should be tapped to provide
5	the expertise as I've done with my county
6	and several other of my colleagues have.
7	And as far as accessibility, we think
8	of it as benefiting a small number of people
9	with disabilities now. What we don't think
10	about is that all of us will acquire a
11	disability as we age if we live long enough.
12	Many of our senior citizens are now having
13	problems with vision and mobility
14	impairments. Many of our veterans from the
15	wars in Iraq and Afghanistan are coming back
16	with service-related disabilities. It's not
17	just a small special interest group. It
18	really benefits all of us.
19	And as far as 1386, last year my county
20	board asked me to help them recruit people
21	with disabilities to serve as election

- inspectors because they, like everyone else,
- are having trouble finding enough people.
- 24 And my agency serves about 2 to 3,000 people

a year. We sent out invitations. We go	l	a year.	We sent out invitations.	We go
--	---	---------	--------------------------	-------

- 2 not one single response, which really
- 3 surprised me. But, as it turns out, very
- 4 few people with disabilities were able to
- 5 endure a fifteen-hour shift. They just
- 6 couldn't do it. They were willing to do a
- 7 five-hour shift, a seven-hour shift, but
- 8 fifteen hours they couldn't do. So I think
- 9 this bill would help bring in more potential
- inspectors by just opening it up for more
- 11 people.
- 12 And thank you.
- SENATOR ADDABBO: Thank you, Mr.
- 14 Pannisi.
- MR. PANNISI: Yes.
- SENATOR ADDABBO: Any questions from
- my colleagues?
- 18 Mr. Fagan, Mr. Pannisi, you should know
- that, as we go through these hearings
- 20 throughout the state, we are starting to
- see, I guess, common problems, whether they

- be in Albany, Manhattan, you know, or here,
- so this is why these hearings are helpful,
- as we start to the address these most common

1	problems.
2	So with the change in dynamics of the
3	voting process with the increased amount of
4	voters, the issues of accessibility and the
5	issues of different training for poll
6	workers to handle the different and changing
7	climate patterns of our voting population,
8	that's why these hearings are helpful, so we
9	can start to work on these issues. So I
10	thank you again both for your time and
11	testimony. Thank you very much.
12	Our next panel, Diane Dwire, chair of
13	Onondaga Democratic County Committee, and
14	Dustin Czarny, chairman of 17th ward, City
15	of Syracuse.
16	DIANE DWIRE
17	Chairwoman
18	Onondaga Democratic County Committee
19	MS. DWIRE: Senator Addabbo, Senator
20	Griffo and Senator Valesky, I thank you very
21	much for giving me the opportunity to speak

- on these proposed bills. I'm going to only
- comment and I will try to be very brief --
- 24 SENATOR VALESKY: Thank you.

1	MS. DWIRE: hopefully on four of
2	them. The first one is the early voting.
3	You know, I agree with this concept. I
4	think the issue is not long waiting lines.
5	I think it's really giving the people the
6	flexibility. And in the proposal it
7	suggests one week. I might suggest, instead
8	of one week in one place, it would be the
9	weekend before in multiple places. But, as
10	has been stated, this certainly does create
11	some problems and because of the multiple
12	different types of ballots that we have.
13	One of the things that I would say
14	requiring the voteand I read thisto be
15	counted within 24 hours, I think, is very
16	unrealistic if we're talking about a paper
17	ballot. I know it goes on a little bit
18	here, in canvassing, and it's just an
19	unrealistic expectation. But we, I think,
20	should look into that.

This next one is 2868-A, the additional

- information on the absentee ballots. And
- I'd like to say as a health care
- professional, a nurse, this almost strikes

1	me as a violation of HIPAA, reg. violations,
2	but I know it truly is not a HIPAA
3	violation. But for the state to require
4	such information that is very personable,
5	regarding even their physician and their
6	hospital or where they're going on vacation,
7	it certainly does create some which is
8	I think this is material that is FOILable
9	creates some serious concerns. And I would
10	very much urge that this be passed
11	immediately.
12	One of the other things, though, that's
13	not quite mentioned in here is that when we
14	look at absentee ballots and as several
15	people have suggested maybe using more of
16	that than the early voting, is that we
17	really need to maybe look at the reason why
18	absentee ballots are disqualified. I think
19	of the coffee rings, the extraneous marks,
20	and I understand it 'cause I've sat it on
21	those sessions when we go over absentee

- ballots. But I also know my 89-year-old
- father, who is a permanent absentee ballot,
- is 89 years old and could easily spill

1 c	offee on	the ballot.	And,	therefore,	they
-----	----------	-------------	------	------------	------

- 2 should not really be disqualified, and I
- 3 know they don't know that.
- 4 The next one, 1701, I think our
- 5 election inspectors, you know, they work one
- 6 to two days a year, they're very good,
- 7 they're very competent and they take their
- 8 job very responsible, but they are humans
- 9 and humans make errors. So, if a voter is,
- you know, inadvertently given an affidavit
- ballot in the wrong voting election
- district, then I think that really -- ballot
- should be counted. However, this does
- create, once again, different problems
- because it may be the wrong ballot and only
- those elections that would pertain to them
- in their proper election district could be
- counted, which is actually why I would very
- much prefer the other...I just lost my place
- for a second...that I would very much prefer
- 21 the bill 6991 -- or I'm not sure which one

- it is. There's 2443. It seems to be the
- same. This one would require voters to be
- 24 directed to the correct polling place in an

1	election district. If the intent of the
2	various proposed legislation is to increase
3	voter turnout and to assure that each vote
4	is counted, we have to come into the 21st
5	century. It is argued that paper copies and
6	of maps and street-finders can be very,
7	very voluminous. This is true, but not an
8	acceptable excuse. In today's age of
9	technology, we have computers, palm pilots
10	and other electronic devices that could be
11	used by the inspectors to be linked directly
12	to the voter registration system to look up
13	the voters and provide them with the
14	accurate information of where to vote.
15	We should at least start to implement
16	this in larger cities. The paper hard
17	copies is a doable in many of the towns and
18	villages. In fact, in the Town of Camillus,
19	street-finders at polling places were at one
20	time provided to the inspectors in order to
21	direct voters to their proper voting place.

- However, this is not true for all of the
- towns.
- To implement this legislation, each

polling place, though, I believe should be

1

18

19

20

2	required to have what I would call a
3	coordinator who would solely be responsible
4	for assisting the voters to the correct
5	election district. It just does not seem
6	appropriate for you've got inspectors
7	doing multi tasks. There may be one person
8	dedicated. I'd like to share one quick
9	thing. In the past election we identified
10	several voting places in Onondaga County and
11	we had some of our volunteers, our, quote,
12	co-watchers, who were there actually
13	voluntarily coordinating, calling us at
14	headquarters; we were looking up where
15	election polls were so they could help
16	direct. The calls get swamped. So I think
17	it's something we maybe need to start with a

21 So I would say, if you were truly

beneficial.

pilot because it certainly would be a lot of

training, but I think it would be extremely

- sincere about increasing voter participation
- versus voter suppression, we must have
- reform in our election laws and funding for

1	the counties	must be	provided so	it can be

- 2 implemented. Thank you.
- 3 SENATOR ADDABBO: Thank you, Ms.
- 4 Dwire.
- 5 MS. DWIRE: Was I quick?
- 6 SENATOR ADDABBO: You did very good.
- 7 MR. Czarny.
- 8 DUSTIN CZARNY
- 9 Chairman
- 10 City of Syracuse, 17th Ward
- 11 MR. CZARNY: Senators, thank you for
- allowing me to testify today. I've been an
- activist for voting rights for all my entire
- adult life. I think I was born into it.
- 15 And I'm chair of a very active ward here in
- 16 Syracuse. I'm going to be brief. I do want
- to touch on most of these bills here, but,
- before I do, I would ask and encourage the
- senate to look into ways to help fund these
- various bills. Passing these amendments
- 21 through our constitution will have no effect

- if the current level of funding for the
- elections boards across the county and
- 24 across the state aren't kept up. We need to

1	have an investment in our own democracy,
2	which is a very important investment. It
3	will lead to a better participation at all
4	levels of government and we'll reap benefits
5	from that fruit for generations to come if
6	we can do that. And as the Empire State, I
7	think we can.
8	In the first bill, the Early Voting
9	Act, I'm a father of a 19-year-old freshman
10	who chose to go to the University of South
11	Florida and, much to my chagrin, actually
12	changed her registration down there last
13	year because, in her words, we needed the
14	votes there more than we needed the votes
15	here. And so I had to agree with her. And
16	she participated in the early voting in
17	Florida and stood in long lines, a couple of
18	hours, to do so. I'm definitely in favor of
19	early voting here in New York State. I
20	think there's a way to do it. Again, it
21	must be funded. We must have those funds to

- do this. Having one location inside a
- county, just a county Board of Elections, is
- not enough.

1	We have a very big mall that we I'm
2	sure they'll be looking to rent space in.
3	These are places that with our modern
4	technology we can, you know, link into the
5	voter database, that we can have early
6	voting places throughout the county,
7	especially in federal election years where
8	there's such a high need and want for voting
9	that but it must be funded. If we just
10	put this mandate out there, it will not be
11	realized. However, early voting, you know
12	although absentee ballot voting, as Mr.
13	Szczesniak said, could help with that
14	situation, I think many voters like the
15	tactile sensation of actually going in there
16	and marking a ballot, pushing a button or
17	clicking a lever. And to you know, that
18	is a I know I feel proud as a citizen
19	when I go in to vote, and, if somebody wants
20	to early vote and stand in those lines and
21	do that. I think we should find a way to

- make that possible.
- However, coming to the absentee ballot
- vote, absentee ballots, S5028 and S2868,

1	which I believe pretty much go together, it
2	is ridiculous that we, you know, require in
3	this day and age a reason for an absentee
4	ballot. We have single-parent families who
5	may not be able to get out of the house to
6	go vote. We have people who work and travel
7	long commutes to and from their job and may
8	only have a few hours throughout their day
9	where they could actually get to the polling
10	place, and if they see long lines when they
11	get there they're going to pull their car
12	out and go to the responsibilities of their
13	families.
14	If they know ahead of time it would be
15	easier and more beneficial for them to do an
16	absentee ballot, by all means, we should
17	find a way to make that possible. Removing
18	that language from the absentee ballot would
19	allow that.
20	S1701, although I'm in favor of this in
21	theory, I do have to worry about the

- practicality of it, especially in odd
- election years where there are local
- 24 elections going on. It seems like it may be

1	a little too permissive. On a countywide
2	level, even in state election years where we
3	have state senate state assemblies,
4	you're talking about two-thirds of the
5	county where you would go to vote if you
6	were in the wrong place that your ballot may
7	not be counted for anything but a statewide
8	or countywide race because you're voting
9	the affidavit ballot in the polling places
10	will be different than the affidavit ballot
11	that would be in your true polling place and
12	so your vote will not be counted in the
13	elections throughout, especially on the
14	local level. And in on add election year
15	like this, where we have many city races
16	going on this year, if you just decide to go
17	across the border to Dewitt, those ballots
18	are not going to be available, and on a very
19	busy Election Day they may not be able to
20	get to the right place. So I think we need
21	to actually put this one on the voters a

- little bit. However, this could be resolved
- by making this maybe a town or citywide
- instead of countywide change.

1	This will resolve that issue for all
2	but the lowest level of district counselor
3	or towns that have a ward system where they
4	have district town counsels. And although
5	there may be instances where some votes are
6	not counted for those races, there will also
7	be a most of the I think the spirit
8	that what we are trying to do here with this
9	will be allowed to count. And I think the
10	benefits of that will far outweigh the
11	problems that are happening.
12	I don't think anybody has any issue
13	with requiring that the polling places be
14	accessible to the disabled. I do think that
15	there is some question of how we do that.
16	And I'm not even going to really touch on
17	that too much. However, authorizing the
18	Board of Elections to employ election
19	inspectors to work half-day shifts, from
20	what I understand, you're not requiring
21	half-day shifts but you're authorizing them

- 22 to have half-day shifts in some inspection
- cases. And I believe that will open up the
- pool of inspectors and we will get a better

1	quality of inspector as well by opening up
2	that pool.
3	We may have teachers who work in a
4	school that is a polling place who decide,
5	after their teaching day is ending at 2:00,
6	to work the two-to-nine shift. This will be
7	a great opportunity to have a higher level
8	of inspector. You can still have inspectors
9	that work all day, so you can have the
10	history of what happened in that polling
11	place throughout the day that can be
12	reported on. But, if you're allowing for
13	half-day inspectors, I think, you know, and
14	people who are working shift work, we're
15	going to open up that position to people
16	that may serve the public a little bit
17	better and also be fresher throughout the
18	day. 6:00 a.m. To 9:00 p.m. is a very long
19	day, and I work it every Election Day so I
20	know by 9:00 p.m. I'm not as responsive to

the people calling me on the phone as I was

- 22 at 6:00 a.m.
- 23 SENATOR ADDABBO: It's actually a
- 24 much longer day because you have to get

there earlier and by the time --

1

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2	MR. CZARNY: That's right, and they
3	have to count the ballots at the end.
4	So, you know, lastly, S2443, I think
5	this is going to be the most expensive of
6	the options, and again I urge that New York
7	State actually fund this option.
8	Commissioner Ryan brought forth an example
9	of a software system, a hand-held software
10	system that can help in this, which is
11	45,000 in the first year. Again, this seems
12	like a lot of money in these tough economic
13	times, but again it is an investment in our

democracy. And if we are going to try to

get our voters to the right polls, a lot of

say call and try to find out the

times if you're just giving them a card and

information, if the phone line is busy or if

they're busy, they're not going to make that

they're not going to come back. Having the

call. They're just going to leave and

- information there at the polling place will
- 23 allow these people to vote quicker and be --
- you know, and we will get those people to

- 1 the right polling place, which may just be a
- 2 couple blocks away, especially if the other
- 3 provision is not passed for the countywide
- 4 voting.
- 5 So again I urge that we adopt that
- 6 measure, but I also urge we adopt it with
- 7 funds to back it up.
- 8 SENATOR ADDABBO: Mr. Czarny and Ms.
- 9 Dwire, thank you very much for testimony and
- your suggestions as well. I really
- appreciate the suggestion part as we go
- forward, so thank you very much.
- 13 MR. CZARNY: Thank you.
- 14 SENATOR ADDABBO: Our next panel, Dr.
- Wanda Warren Berry, director of New Yorkers
- for Verified Voting, and Dr. Grant Reeher...
- 17 I apologize if I mispronounced the name.
- 18 SENATOR VALESKY: Reeher.
- 19 SENATOR ADDABBO: Reeher. I'm so
- sorry.
- 21 DR. WANDA WARREN BERRY

22	Director
23	New Yorkers for Verified Voting
24	DR. BERRY: Shall I go first? Good

1	morning, Senator Addabbo and Valesky and
2	Griffo.
3	And I'm glad to put a face with a name
4	David Kogelman. I'm Wanda Warren Barry,
5	director of New Yorkers for Verified Voting.
6	We refer to that as NYVV.
7	We are a nonprofit citizens group which
8	has been advocating for election integrity
9	in New York during the five years that the
10	state has faced the challenge of the Help
11	America Vote Act. On our website NYVV
12	publishes its aim as "to ensure that all
13	eligible citizens can vote and that their
14	votes will be accurately counted."
15	During the years leading up to the
16	counties' choices of equipment for HAVA
17	compliance, under the leadership of our
18	former director, Bo Lipari, we were
19	recognized as a driving force behind the
20	strong grassroots effort to advocate for a
21	system based on voter- marked paper ballots.

- That choice now having been made, NYVV's
- 23 current focus is on encouraging citizen
- oversight of the implementation of this

1	system through procedures and practices that
2	promote security during the recording and
3	counting of the votes. While we stand ready
4	to oppose and critique any voting systems,
5	procedures or policies that could violate a
6	citizen's right to vote, our particular
7	emphasis is on technological and procedural
8	accuracy and security. Therefore, I will
9	emphasize these aspects of the bills before
10	you today.
11	And I won't speak to all of the bills.
12	I'll try to shorten this. First, the Early
13	Voting Act, our position now is that early
14	voting ought not to be adopted until New
15	York has in place careful procedures and
16	arrangements to keep both the machines and
17	ballots secure during an extended period for
18	the casting of ballots. While we support
19	every reasonable effort to encourage more
20	people to vote, our constituents in NYVV at
21	this point disagree with one another about

- the value of early voting, and I receive
- arguments on both sides. Therefore, we
- believe this bill should be tabled until

1	there is more evidence that early voting
2	actually is effective enough in improving
3	voter turnout to make it worth the extra
4	demand for staffing and security. Another
5	reason for delaying action on this issue, we
6	think, is that it seems unwise to institute
7	early voting at the same time that New York
8	is implementing a completely new voting
9	system. So we suggest tabling that.
10	With regard to what's called no-excuse
11	absentee voting, many of our constituents
12	support these measures to allow the state to
13	protect the privacy of voters who apply for
14	an absentee ballot. It's trueand I
15	another colleague of mine will go into more
16	detail with this laterthat the absentee
17	ballot is intimidating to some people and
18	discourages them from voting even when they
19	can't get to a polling place.
20	I do want to point out that absentee
21	ballots sent by mail are inevitably less

- secure than those cast in the polling place;
- therefore, every possible step must be taken
- 24 to protect both the security and privacy of

1	absentee ballots.
2	I want to skip down then to Bill
3	1836-A, the proposal that would allow
4	election inspectors to work half-day shifts.
5	NYVV supports this proposal so and I like
6	the way the bill is written that calls for
7	at least one inspector from each major party
8	to be there for the whole Election Day.
9	Most of the inspectors we've talked to
10	support this bill, and many of us are
11	election inspectors.
12	I do want to point out particularly the
13	concerns for security and accuracy that
14	cause us to support this measure. People
15	who are tired are more apt to make mistakes
16	than when they're not so tired. The
17	security procedures for the new equipment
18	that have been described to us will take
19	alertness and attention to detail at every
20	step, especially in opening and closing the
21	polls. Therefore, half-day shifts for at

- least some workers seem to be indicated so
- that people are alert and able to do that.
- I have more concern and I know there's

1	more controversy about the bill numbered
2	5112. This is the bill that would require a
3	place in the ballot to indicate that one has
4	intentionally undervoted. With a few
5	members of NYVV dissenting from this
6	position, the majority of our board of
7	directors and steering committee believes
8	that New York's law should not require
9	undervote notification in the programming of
10	the scanners. Only overvote notification is
11	required by HAVA.
12	As a matter of fact, so far we don't
13	know of other states that require undervote
14	notification. We should research that, but
15	we haven't found any.
16	We believe the opportunity to correct
17	the ballot for which HAVA calls is provided
18	when you have a paper ballot that can be
19	reviewed in the privacy booth and replaced
20	if the voter asks for a new copy. And that
21	could be done before submission to the

- scanner.
- Therefore, we think this change in the
- ballot is unnecessary and that it will

1	confuse voters. Instead, the undervote
2	notification requirement should be rescinded
3	in New York so that scanners would not be
4	programmed to do undervote notification but
5	only overvote. We urge instead that the
6	senate develop a bill that would amend
7	Election Law 6209.28 to delete the phrase
8	"or undervote." This is the sentence that
9	would be changed: "In a paper ballot"I'm
10	quoting now"In a paper-based voting
11	system, the system must indicate to the
12	voter specific contests or ballot issues for
13	which an overvote or undervote is detected."
14	We suggest deleting "or undervote."
15	There are several reasons for this
16	change; first, the protection of privacy.
17	Notice that HAVA advises in the section
18	following the description of need to notify
19	of overvotes, advises that, quote, "any
20	notification required under this paragraph
21	preserve the privacy of the voter and the

- confidentiality of the ballot." We have
- found that automatic notification of an
- 24 undervote is seen by many as threatening the

1	privacy of their vote. Especially in small
2	jurisdictions with a short ballot, it might
3	seem easy for those in the polling place to
4	know when a voter deliberately did not vote
5	in an uncontested race.
6	Reports from states that already have
7	implemented paper-ballot scanner systems
8	suggest that voters are confused even when
9	the scanners warn only of overvotes, and
10	there's a tendency for the poll workers to
11	get involved and for a jeopardization of
12	privacy.
13	We also would point out that automatic
14	notification of undervotes will slow the
15	submissions of ballots to the scanners. We
16	would like to point out that adding the box
17	for the voter to indicate an intentional
18	undervoting as in this proposed bill is an
19	unnecessary complication of the process of
20	learning the new voting system since
21	notification of undervotes was not required

- on the lever machines.
- I want to then point out that, if the
- 24 election law requiring a notification of

1	undervotes is not amended, some kind of
2	arrangement needs to be made to override
3	undervote notification, but I think having
4	the box to indicate intentional undervoting
5	at the top of the ballot is not as good a
6	solution as having that box at the bottom of
7	the ballot.
8	In sum, we believe that, if voters are
9	carefully educated about the ballot and
10	encouraged to review it in the privacy
11	booth, undervote notification is unnecessary
12	on the scanners and that requirement should
13	be rescinded. However, we realize that
14	there may need to continue to be undervote
15	notification on the ballot marking devices.
16	I'm going to just mention one thing
17	that came up in my dialogue with members of
18	my board in the last couple of days, and I
19	want to make sure it's known that this
20	recommendation doesn't grow out of any
21	experience with election commissioners in

- this room, because I think they don't need
- 23 the training I'm going to suggest. But I do
- hear from people around the state who do not

1	have confidence in us moving forward with
2	this new system and confidence in the way
3	their vote will be counted because they do
4	not have confidence in the professional
5	training of their election commissioners.
6	As an educator, I want to encourage
7	development of legislation that would
8	require certification of election
9	commissioners. Modern elections and their
10	technologies are complex and ought no longer
11	to be managed by persons who lack specific
12	training for their positions. While many
13	commissioners conscientiously attend
14	workshops over the years and are qualified
15	by years of experience, even they would be
16	benefited by a process that would recognize
17	that they are professionals, that their work
18	requires training and expertise.
19	The day is past when we can assume that
20	anyone nominated by a county political
21	committee is able to run elections.

- Training schools might be provided by the
- state on the model of those offered for
- persons elected as town clerks and justices.

1	r also suggest that certifying programs
2	could be developed in regional community
3	colleges, and I've suggested some of the
4	courses that might be there, like computer
5	skills, mathematics and so forth, ethics for
6	election administrators.
7	While many of our commissioners could
8	be certified without further training, it is
9	time to make sure all of our elections are
10	in the hands of qualified persons with
11	professional training.
12	Thank you.
13	SENATOR ADDABBO: Thank you, Dr.
14	Berry.
15	Dr. Reeher.
16	DR. GRANT REEHER
17	DR. REEHER: Thank you, Senator
18	Addabbo, Senator Valesky, Senator Griffo,
19	for the opportunity to testify today. I
20	don't have copies of my testimony ready to
21	share, but I'll polish what I'm about to say

- and send that by --
- 23 SENATOR ADDABBO: Please do.
- DR. REEHER: -- very quickly. We're

limited to three minutes, and, as you might

- 2 gather, three minutes to an academic is like
- a nanosecond. So I'll get right to my
- 4 conclusion.
- 5 The answer is yes. That is, I'm
- 6 generally in favor of these proposals as a
- 7 group, but I also have a broader lingering
- 8 reservation.
- 9 Regarding the yes, I think anything
- that opens up the voting process further,
- that makes it more inclusive and easier to
- vote, is likely to have a positive effect on
- voting levels and simply provides people
- greater opportunities to vote. So, from a
- small-D democratic perspective, these seem
- to be good ideas, and, as I'm sure you know,
- 17 New York is one of the more restrictive
- states when it comes to voting and
- 19 participation rules, so you could argue that
- the changes are even more needed here.
- 21 Having said that, I'd also note,

- though, that none of these is going to lead
- to a revolution in higher voter turnout, and
- I'm sure you know that as well.

1	One thing I would note in that regard,
2	though, is the research from my political
3	science colleagues recently suggests that a
4	particularly effective difference-maker for
5	people voting is not rules or technological
6	changes but, rather, in-person appeals to
7	vote, the power of peers working in real
8	space and real time. And that finding
9	actually ties in with my broader
10	reservation, which I'll get to in just a
11	second.
12	The one proposal here that I find
13	particularly entreating is the last one on
14	the list. It's gotten a lot of attention so
15	far allowing the voter to state the
16	intentionality of undervoting. If I
17	understand that proposal correctly, you can
18	see it as a very weak version of a "none of
19	the above" option, which exists right now
20	only in Nevada in the United States, and
21	even there it's a nonbinding result.

- I actually think "none of the above"
- would be a good idea in New York and this
- slight nod toward it is a good thing, I

1	think. But here's the big reservation I
2	have. John Madden used to like to say that
3	NFL football needed more bunting, not the
4	baseball kind of bunting but the red, white
5	and blue kind that you hang from your window
6	or the sky box of the stadium. I think our
7	voting also needs more bunting, and what I
8	mean by that is that our day of voting needs
9	to be wrapped in a civic pageant that makes
10	it more of a shared community event, a
11	shared state event, even a shared national
12	event, and that helps to invest it in a
13	greater civic meaning. And so our voting
14	days, I think, need to be more genuine
15	holidays, they need to be days of
16	reflection, days of deliberation,
17	conversation and civic celebration.
18	In order to do that, the day itself
19	has to maintain its importance, and the act
20	of voting needs to be something that we do
21	together at one time. And there needs to

- be, I think, an actual moment of decision.
- And viewed from that perspective, some of
- these proposals and others that have

1	recently been instituted in other states to
2	make voting easier arguably dilute that to
3	some degree, and I'm referring here
4	particularly to the Early Voting Act and the
5	removal of restrictions on absentee voting.
6	Now, other proposals here, of course,
7	strengthen the civic value that I'm
8	describing, the provisions for the disabled,
9	the requirement to direct voters who are in
10	the wrong place to the right place. But
11	from this perspective of creating a civic
12	community event, I think you'd want to focus
13	on making voting on the day easier but also
14	to preserve that day's importance. So
15	things like requiring employers to give time
16	off for voting or holding our elections on
17	Sunday or having more polling places all
18	make sense from that perspective.
19	But, again, from the standpoint with a
20	couple of the proposals that are under
21	consideration here, what we may be doing is

- chasing a slightly higher turnout, which is
- a valuable goal, at the expense of changing
- something important about the civic nature

1	of the very enterprise itself.
2	Having said all that, then I awake from
3	my ancient Greek city state dream and
4	conclude on balance that the additional ease
5	of voting not only on the day but before
6	that day is probably a desired thing, so, to
7	go back to my conclusion, the answer is yes.
8	SENATOR ADDABBO: Dr. Reeher, thank
9	you very much. Any questions from my
10	colleagues?
11	SENATOR GRIFFO: Professor, I don't
12	think you should shrink away from the Greek
13	dream. It would probably be something that
14	is a great encouraging aspect to try to get
15	a national debate on the date itself. I
16	mean many other countries use weekends and
17	we tend to continue to look at that Tuesday.
18	So I think that's a very valuable subject
19	for consideration and discussion and
20	advocacy.
21	The question I would have is, relative

- to when we talk about some of these
- procedures, while they're tending to make it
- easier, could it also be problematic in the

1	sense that in the last week of an election
2	things change; if you have early voting,
3	something dramatically may happen where
4	somebody may have thought gee, I wish I had
5	the opportunity to cast my vote again. Is
6	that a problem, do you see?
7	DR. REEHER: Well, that's always the
8	issue and the tradeoff that you're making
9	with early voting. Again, the research
10	tends to indicate that most elections most
11	of the time, by the time you get to that
12	point, most voters' preferences are pretty
13	well locked in, for the general election, at
14	least for the big top-ticket races. I mean
15	there always is movement at the end, and
16	certainly we've seen that if we go back the
17	last 16 years or so, you can see evidence of
18	people making up ground at the last second.
19	But that you know, but that is the risk.
20	I think the theme that I would
21	emphasize here today, though, is, in going

- back to what you started with, to the degree
- that we want to make this a meaningful
- thing... and that's really what our European

1	counterparts do a better job of than we
2	dohaving the elections on Sunday is one
3	thing; there are other things that they do
4	as well. You've got to keep that day being
5	very, very important and have it be
6	something that we do together.
7	SENATOR GRIFFO: Thank you.
8	DR. REEHER: Sure.
9	SENATOR ADDABBO: Thank you very
10	much, Senator Griffo. There being no other
11	questions, I want to thank this panel very
12	much for their time today. Thank you very
13	much.
14	Our next panel is Reginald Neale,
15	Citizens for a Better New York, and Nina
16	Kohn, Professor of Syracuse University
17	College of Law.
18	I want to thank you both for being here
19	today. Please state your name for the
20	record and give your testimony.
21	NINA KOHN

- 22 Associate Professor of Syracuse University
- College of Law
- 24 MS. KOHN: Thank you Senator, Chair

1	and Senators, for allowing me to be here
2	today. My name is Nina Kohn. I'm an
3	Associate Professor at Syracuse University
4	College of Law where my research focuses on
5	the civil rights of older adults and where
6	I've had the opportunity to study and write
7	about access to voting by persons with
8	disabilities and senior citizens. My
9	testimony today will focus on senate bill
10	1058-A.
11	1058-A represents an improvement over
12	current law and will help bring our state
13	into compliance with federal law. Instead
14	of simply stating that there must be an
15	accessible entrance but allowing a waiver,
16	1058-A requires all polling places to be
17	accessible to citizens with disabilities and
18	comply with the accessibility guidelines of
19	the Americans with Disabilities Act.
20	While I support this bill, I believe it
21	does not go far enough. Specifically, I'm

- 22 concerned that it will fail to make voting
- 23 accessible to all citizens with disabilities
- for two primary reasons.

1	First, the bill focuses on access to
2	polling places and not on access to voting
3	itself. But it's not enough to be able to
4	get in the door of the polling places. To
5	successfully vote, the voter must be able to
6	access the ballot, comprehend the ballot and
7	register voting preferences. Accordingly,
8	elections are only truly accessible when
9	voting equipment is accessible, election
10	staff understand and can use that equipment
11	and appropriate assistance is available to
12	those who need it.
13	The ADA guidelines with which this bill
14	would require compliance don't address these
15	issues. They provide detailed guides as to
16	the design of other facilitiesmini golf
17	courses, piers but they say nothing about
18	polling places, voting equipment or election
19	procedures. Moreover, they generally only
20	apply to the design or construction of new
21	facilities or the alteration of existing

- ones.
- 23 I would, therefore, encourage this
- 24 committee to amend the bill to cover voting

1	equipment and procedures as well as polling
2	places. The first sentence of a revised
3	bill might read something like replacing the
4	words "each polling place" with "all polling
5	places, voting equipment and procedures".
6	Okay. Second, the bill focuses only on
7	the physical accessibility of voting, and I
8	would urge this committee to address, either
9	in this bill or in future legislation, the
10	cognitive accessibility voting. Physical
11	disabilities are only one form of disability
12	that can prevent citizens from being able to
13	exercise their right to vote. Cognitive
14	disabilities, even those as seemingly minor
15	as short-term memory loss or mild confusion,
16	can really create formidable barriers to
17	voting, and that's true even where those
18	disabilities don't rise to the level that
19	they undermine the capacity to make informed
20	voting choices.

So a number of reforms are possible

- that could reduce the extent to which
- cognitive disability prevents would-be
- voters from exercising their fundamental

1	right to vote.
2	A key reform in this state would be to
3	change on very outdated election law, New
4	York Election Law 5.1066, that, in clear
5	opposition to our limited guardianship
6	scheme, denies the right to vote to anyone
7	adjudicated incompetent regardless of
8	whether they've been adjudicated incompetent
9	to vote or not.
10	Other reforms could focus on polling
11	place conditions, such as low lighting and
12	distracting noises, that increase the
13	cognitive demands of voting and thus may
14	effectively make voting impossible for
15	certain citizens.
16	Other reforms could focus on ballot
17	design, eliminating unduly complex and
18	confusing ballots. Finally, actually making
19	the absentee balloting process less complex,
20	as two of the bills being considered here
21	today would do, could also help make voting

- 22 more cognitively accessible to persons with
- disabilities.
- In considering these forms, the

1	committee might find informative the
2	American Bar Association's new
3	recommendations regarding voting by persons
4	with mental and cognitive disabilities.
5	In conclusion, I think 1058-A is a step
6	in the right direction, but it really does
7	fall short of making voting accessible.
8	Attention needs to be paid to the physical
9	and cognitive barriers to voting that remain
10	even once someone has crossed the threshold
11	into the polling place.
12	Thank you for your consideration.
13	SENATOR ADDABBO: Thank you,
14	Professor Kohn. Thank you.
15	Sir, you're up.
16	REGINALD NEALE
17	Citizens for a Better New York
18	MR. NEALE: Good morning, Senator
19	Addabbo, Senator Griffo and Senator Valesky
20	Thank you for the opportunity to testify
21	here this morning.

- 22 My name is Reginald Neale. I live at
- 23 6032 County Road 41 in Farmington. I have
- been a resident of New York State my entire

1	life. I'm a member of Citizens for a Better
2	New York, a nonpartisan group working for
3	reform of state government.
4	As you know, CFBNY is currently
5	addressing several reform issues. Our
6	members have testified at several senate
7	hearings across the state. However, my
8	testimony today reflects my personal views,
9	which are not necessarily those of my
10	organization.
11	I want to thank you and Senator Smith
12	for providing this forum. I certainly hope
13	that the state senate is setting an enduring
14	precedent with these statewide hearings.
15	Let us hope that this demonstrates a new
16	commitment to making real-world connections
17	with citizens and to documenting their input
18	on important issues. The senate's new web
19	link that encourages on-line public comments
20	on pending legislation is also a valuable
21	new tool.

- Rather than comment in detail on the
- bills that were listed for discussion today,
- I'd just like to make some brief comments.

1	In general, I support legislation that
2	improves voter access or process. And there
3	are additional comments in my written
4	testimony. Much of the discussion to date
5	has been about the effects of legislation on
6	the general election, but primary elections
7	are a critical component of needed reforms
8	to state government. Challengers who run in
9	primaries are often individuals who are
10	motivated to make changes and to implement
11	reforms. Yet both major political parties
12	have historically used primaries as a tool
13	to block challenges and to reduce the
14	choices available to voters. We must make
15	sure that primary elections are fair and
16	that they preserve the widest possible range
17	of electoral choices for citizens.
18	I support changes to election law like
19	those proposed by Senate Bill 355, 1366 and
20	Assembly Bill 4161 and 2651, which affect
21	petition requirements.

- There are two other issues, which may
- 23 at first seem peripheral to today's
- discussion but which, in my opinion, are

1	central to the idea of fair elections.
2	First, even if all the election law problems
3	which have been discussed before this
4	committee were solved, voters are still
5	being deprived of fair representation
6	because the boundaries of legislative
7	districts are distorted for political
8	advantage.
9	I hope you and your committee will
10	support the creation of a truly independent
11	commission with authority to draw
12	legislative district lines.
13	Second, fair elections are impossible
14	without campaign finance reform. As long as
15	wealthy individuals or those supported by
16	special interests or backed by the political
17	establishment are the only ones who can
18	afford to run an effective election
19	campaign, our state legislature will
20	continue to be the most dysfunctional in the
21	nation. I'm glad to see that you have

- scheduled future hearings dedicated to
- 23 campaign finance reform.
- Finally, one can't help but be struck

1	that, in testimony before this committee and
2	also before the Temporary Committee on Rules
3	of Administration, individuals and
4	organizations alike have repeatedly pointed
5	to the Brennan Center's recommendations.
6	Citizens and good-government groups all
7	across the state largely agree on the kinds
8	of changes that need to be made. There is
9	never a shortage of good ideas. The real
10	deficit has been leadership. Leadership
11	develops the political consensus for
12	implementing solutions.
13	I hope that you, your committee and the
14	senate as a whole will maintain your
15	momentum. You have my support and
16	encouragement. Please do not fail to take
17	maximum advantage of your new tools. Your
18	goal must be real changes in state
19	government, changes that can restore New
20	York State to its historic position as a
21	world leader in jobs, education, finance and

- health care.
- Thank you for your attention.
- 24 SENATOR ADDABBO: Thank you, Mr.

1	Neare.	Any	questions	irom	my	coneagues?	1

- 2 want to thank both of you for your
- 3 testimony.
- 4 I have one real quick question for
- 5 Professor Kohn.
- 6 You said the American Bar Association
- 7 had a report?
- 8 MS. KOHN: Yes, and I'd be happy to
- 9 provide that to your staff.
- 10 SENATOR ADDABBO: If you can, please,
- that would be helpful.
- 12 Thank you very much, both of you.
- 13 Again appreciate your time here today.
- Our next panel, Charles Pierce-El,
- National Action Network, and Lenore
- Rapalski, director of Advocacy for Syracuse
- 17 League of Women Voters.
- 18 Mr. Pierce-El.
- 19 CHARLES PIERCE-EL
- National Action Network
- 21 MR. PIERCE-EL: First of all, I want

- 22 to thank you senators for coming here to
- 23 Syracuse, New York and opening up this
- process. It's been way overdue.

1	SENATOR ADDABBO: Thank you.
2	MR. PIERCE-EL: Senator Addabbo,
3	Senator David Valesky, my senator, and
4	Senator Joseph Griffo and counselor and
5	young lady, thank you for coming here to
6	Syracuse to hear our complaints and hear our
7	concerns.
8	SENATOR ADDABBO: Thank you.
9	MR. PIERCE-EL: On behalf of the
10	Alliance Network I'm playing with three
11	hats here, but, first of all, Senator, I'd
12	like to tell you something that's very
13	disturbing and, you know, you can take it
14	either way. You brought some bad weather
15	here 'cause we had good weather. We had
16	good weather here up until you came here
17	late.
18	SENATOR ADDABBO: I'm sorry. I'll
19	try to take it back with me. Fair enough?
20	MR_PIERCE_EL: Thank you appreciate

that. Fair enough. Secondly, on behalf on

- the Alliance Network, my president Walt
- Dixie, we agree with everything that you
- have set down on here. We agree with

1	everything. He informed me to make sure
2	that I emphasize that, that the Alliance
3	Network was in agreement on everything that
4	you have here.
5	On my other half, I'm also the
6	chairperson of the Southside Homeowners
7	Association, and we too agree with this here
8	on behalf of the Homeowners Association.
9	And as an advocate, a community
10	advocate, I heard a lot of things here
11	today, and a lot of things were good and a
12	lot of things we were not we were not
13	helping you guys with your solutions and I'd
14	like to point out some solutions that I
15	think is way overdue. For a person that
16	history predicts that we have been
17	disenfranchised for a long time in this here
18	country, and I'm a product of that and my
19	ancestors have died to give us this right to
20	vote in this country, this great country of
21	ours, there's a lot of things that need to

- be said that was not said. And the solution
- is: We've asked a lot of times and we asked
- a lot of times of our people and our

1	senators and our elected officials for money
2	to pay, but yet we have a lot of time that
3	we can volunteer. And we don't capitalize
4	on that. And for the senator and for this
5	committee, I would also suggest that we
6	start using our children because this
7	country is based on your children's future.
8	And in my particular district that I can
9	speak on, which is the largest district in
10	the City of Syracuse, the fourth district,
11	our voting is terrible. And our young
12	people do not participate, only because of a
13	lack of education.
14	And our commissioners in this community
15	does not set up enough education; not only
16	the commissioners but organization, like
17	NAACP, the churches, youth organizations,
18	schools, we don't set up enough programs to
19	teach our children to volunteer for some of
20	these things that you guys are putting in
21	place for us. You know, it's just like a

- farmer. A farmer puts out -- a farmer has a
- whole lot of good seeds. Some of those
- seeds are going to flourish and some are

1	not, and he's got to weed them. And we
2	don't do a good job of weeding educating our
3	children as a collective amount of people in
4	our district. And, sir, there should be
5	some stipend somewhere along the line to
6	help educate these children, especially
7	children of my complexion and of the African
8	American community. And I can only speak of
9	Syracuse even though I know it happens
10	across this whole United States. And I
11	would like for this committee, not only for
12	this particular thing, and for my Senator
13	Dave Valesky to help implement some of these
14	changes that need to take place because in
15	our nation in our fourth district
16	election, we have over 7,000 people in that
17	district; only 1,200 turns out. And we have
18	a deciding factor of maybe 500 people
19	deciding who our elected officials are in
20	the City of Syracuse and the fourth
21	district, and that's ludicrous. That is

- terrible. And I think the main point that
- 23 we have to start using and showing our young
- people how to volunteer, and that will take

l up some slack of the pay that normal	1	up some slack	of the pa	ly that no	rmall
--	---	---------------	-----------	------------	-------

2 people are always asking for pay. So with

- 3 the volunteers and maybe some type of
- 4 stipend and educational purposes, I think
- 5 that would help you guys help us and help
- 6 our country grow even with this pilot,
- 7 because this is a pilot and without you guys
- 8 doing this we never would have had this in
- 9 the first place. So I want to thank you
- guys and commend you guys for a job well
- done. Thank you.
- 12 SENATOR ADDABBO: Thank you, Mr.
- 13 Pierce-El. Thank you.
- 14 Ms. Rapalski.
- MS. RAPALSKI: Yes. I have a feeling
- that you may have heard this testimony
- 17 before.
- 18 SENATOR ADDABBO: Yes, in Albany, but
- 19 please.
- MS. RAPALSKI: Yes. I'm Lenore
- 21 Rapalski and --

- 22 SENATOR ADDABBO: If you can
- summarize that --
- MS. RAPALSKI: I will.

1	SENATOR ADDABBO: I would
2	appreciate that.
3	LENORE RAPALSKI
4	Director of Advocacy
5	Syracuse League of Women Voters
6	MS. RAPALSKI: I will. I fully
7	intended to. My name is Lenore Rapalski and
8	I am director of Advocacy and Local Issues
9	for the Syracuse Metro League of Women
10	Voters. The testimony I was going to read
11	today has already been read, for the
12	purposes of the audience behind me, has
13	already been read in Albany, to, I believe,
14	two of you at least. I don't know, Senator
15	Valesky, if you were there.
16	SENATOR VALESKY: No.
17	MS. RAPALSKI: But you can have a
18	copy of it so
19	SENATOR VALESKY: I have it already.
20	MS. RAPALSKI: All right. Pretty
21	much the items that our election

- specialist...that would be Aimee
- Allaud...for the New York State League of
- Women Voters, I have a collection of the

1	oms and also whether we agreed with them
2	or not. Would you like me to read that, not
3	for your purposes but more for the people
4	SENATOR ADDABBO: Again, if you can
5	summarize that portion I'd appreciate it.
6	MS. RAPALSKI: Sure. Senate Bill
7	3250, that is your bill, Senator Addabbo,
8	enacting the Early Voting Act, the League
9	has no position on the early voting, per se,
10	because there has not been opportunity to
11	study the effects.
12	The second, S5028 and S2868-A, that's
13	you, Senator Addabbo, both expand absentee
14	voting by removing unnecessary documentation
15	requirements on the application for an
16	absentee ballot, the League strongly
17	supports both of these measures, and both of
18	the New York State Election Commissioners
19	Association and the New York State Board of
20	Elections also support the measures.
21	Senate Bill 1701 Dilan, the counting

- of affidavit ballots, the League has no
- position on the bill.
- Senate Bill 1058-A, Addabbo, requiring

1	that all polling places be accessible to
2	physically disabled voters, the League
3	supports the bill to amend the New York
4	State Election Law to conform to federal
5	accessibility standards.
6	S1836-A, Klein, permits election
7	inspectors to work half-day shifts, the
8	League supports this measure, which
9	potentially may increase the number of
10	citizens who apply to work as poll
11	inspectors and draw younger individuals into
12	the process.
13	S2443, Stewart-Cousins, the bill has
14	or the League has no position on this bill.
15	Finally, S5112, Foley, in relation to
16	the form of the paper ballot, this bill
17	would add a new subdivision to the election
18	law stating that ballots must provide an
19	area to be filled in by a voter that would
20	notify the voting system that the voter
21	intended to undervote deliberately so the

- optical scanner would not produce an error
- 23 message which would reject the ballot.
- And that's it. Thank you very much.

1	SENATOR ADDABBO: Ms. Rapalski, thank
2	you very much. I appreciate your time.
3	Thank you so much.
4	Our next panel, Robert Spitzer, chair
5	of the political science department for the
6	SUNY-Cortland, and Richard Kendrick, a civil
7	engagement director for SUNY-Cortland. Good
8	afternoon, gentlemen.
9	ROBERT SPITZER
10	Chairman - Political Science Department
11	SUNY-Cortland
12	MR. SPITZER: Good afternoon. Thank
13	you, Mr. Chairman, for the opportunity to
14	testify. I am Robert Spitzer, chair of the
15	political science department at
16	SUNY-Cortland. I believe the proposals
17	all of the proposals under consideration
18	merit speedy passage by the state senate,
19	but I wish to use my limited time to speak
20	primarily about the so-called no-excuse
21	early voting.

- As you know, 32 states allow for early
- voting. In the 2000 presidential elections,
- 24 14 percent of all votes cast nationwide were

1	cast before Election Day. That would
2	include paper voting and in-person voting,
3	early voting. In 2004 nationwide 22 percent
4	of all votes cast were early votes, and last
5	year, 2008, it was a third of all votes
6	cast. Early voting is no longer an
7	experiment. It's instead an integral
8	feature of the voting process across the
9	country.
10	And it has, I think, three obvious
11	benefits without really any measurable
12	drawbacks, and I say that understanding that
13	there are financial startup costs and there
14	are knowledge costs as well. First, it
15	relieves one-day Election Day pressures on
16	election officials and voters by spreading
17	out the voting process. Second, it makes
18	voting more convenient. Third, the measure
19	before the state senate lets early voting
20	occur at local board of election offices
21	where early voting can, in effect, serve as

- a testing ground for equipment and
- procedures before actual Election Day
- 24 arrives.

1	And as to my colleague Grant Reeher's
2	point about Election Day needing more
3	bunting, I certainly agree, but I think he
4	misses the point about early voting. Early
5	voting magnifies the bunting effect because
6	people actually voting will vote and will
7	talk about voting, and it's in-person
8	conversations and the buzz of the election
9	process before Election Day that will add
10	bunting to our electoral process absent
11	moving our Election Day to a Saturday or
12	Sunday.
13	Now, last fall I witnessed early voting
14	in Delaware County, Indiana, on the Saturday
15	before Election Day. It was November 1st.
16	At the county seat of Muncie, I saw nearly
17	300 people standing in line waiting to vote
18	at the county clerk's office. According to
19	the county employee who escorted me,
20	employees were willing to work on a Saturday
21	not only to relieve Election Day pressures

- but to give people the chance to vote on a
- 23 weekend, and, indeed America is virtually
- the only democratic nation that does not

1	hold its elections on the weekend. Support
2	for early voting in Indiana, I should say,
3	is bipartisan.
4	And, finally, let me say one thing
5	about early voting and politics. Some have
6	argued that Barack Obama and the democratic
7	party were advantaged by early voting in
8	last year's elections, but that's not
9	exactly correct. Obama's campaign did adapt
10	its political strategy to early voting
11	trends, but this reflected two important
12	traits. The first is that Obama's campaign
13	was strategically more advanced than was
14	that of his opponent, just as in 2004 George
15	W. Bush's campaign was strategically more
16	advanced than that of his opponent. And,
17	secondly, Obama had far more money to spend
18	on early voting mobilization efforts. The
19	Republicans would have spent it had they had
20	it.

Early voting, as well as no-excuse

- 22 absentee voting, is neither democratic or
- 23 nor republican. It is instead
- pro-democracy.

1	Thank you very much.
2	SENATOR ADDABBO: Thank you, Mr.
3	Spitzer. Thank you.
4	RICHARD KENDRICK
5	Director
6	Institute for Civic Engagement
7	SUNY-Cortland
8	DR. KENDRICK: Senators, thank you
9	very much for the opportunity to be here
10	today. My name is Richard Kendrick. I'm
11	the director of the Institute for Civic
12	Engagement at SUNY-Cortland and a colleague
13	of Bob's.
14	And I'm here to comment specifically on
15	four provisions that I think will enhance
16	student participation in the electoral
17	process. As the director for the Institute
18	for Civic Engagement on our campus, that has
19	been one area of focus for us, is getting
20	students registered to vote, informed to
21	vote and then to the polls to vote on

- Election Day. And I've seen a number of
- obstacles to that process that I think some
- of these provisions will do a lot to

1	rectify.
2	I am particularly supporting S1701 that
3	will require that affidavit ballots be
4	counted if they are cast in the right county
5	but not necessarily the correct polling
6	place; S3250 that will amend the election
7	law to enact early voting because I think
8	that will allow those students who would
9	like to vote in their home towns more
10	accessibility to that opportunity; S5028
11	that will allow absentee voting by qualified
12	voters for any reason and without
13	explanation, particularly if it would be
14	possible for students to actually request a
15	ballot on the voter registration form.
16	Right now they request an application for an
17	absentee ballot.
18	Many students don't understand that
19	that's all they're going to get, is the
20	application. They think, having checked
21	that, they'll get the ballot in the mail.

- They don't understand the process fully. I
- think if they have the opportunity to
- receive a ballot off of something that they

1	can mark on the registration form that would
2	be very advantageous.
3	And then S6991 that requires poll
4	clerks and election workers to provide maps
5	of polling places and assistance to find
6	one's correct polling place would also be
7	very advantageous for those students who are
8	properly registered but just happen to show
9	up at the wrong site as they sometimes do.
10	I would reiterate some of the comments
11	made by others earlier that it would it
12	seems to me to be important that this be
13	automated. Your voter registration and your
14	polling place is now available on-line.
15	It's amazing to me that we don't have
16	laptops at the polling places with internet
17	access so we can look that up right away and
18	send somebody to the right location. And I
19	hope that that can be something that we can
20	work toward.
21	Provision 1386-A that would shorten the

- days -- or the shifts, rather, that poll
- workers would be required to work I think
- would be very helpful for increasing student

1	partici	pauon	as por	i workers.	we ve	nau a

- 2 program at Cortland for several years,
- funded initially by the U.S. Election
- 4 Assistance Commission, to train students as
- 5 poll workers. The response has been
- 6 excellent. I think this would increase the
- 7 likelihood that students would participate
- 8 as poll workers if they didn't have to work
- 9 the extensive shifts that are currently
- 10 required.
- So, in short, I want to indicate my
- support for these provisions. As you may
- know, the State of New York unfortunately
- ranks 40th in the nation in percentage of
- young people ages 18 to 29 who voted in the
- 16 2008 election. I think we can do much
- better, and I think these provisions will
- help.
- Thank you very much.
- 20 SENATOR ADDABBO: Thank you, Mr.
- 21 Kendrick. We do have a question from

- Senator Griffo.
- 23 SENATOR GRIFFO: Dr. Spitzer, when
- you look at Dr. Reeher and you were talking

1	about and I think I find that an
2	interesting concept and he talks about a
3	communal experience, but you talk about
4	generating interest as you lead up to that
5	experience, but isn't that, if you truly
6	want a communal experience leading up to it,
7	it could dilute that on that day, couldn't
8	it?
9	DR. SPITZER: Not to my way of
10	thinking, because the election process a
11	season and it's the it's the acceleration
12	through the season that causes people to
13	focus greater attention on the fact that an
14	election is coming up.
15	SENATOR GRIFFO: Doesn't that already
16	exist in campaigns?
17	DR. SPITZER: Well, campaigns have
18	that very effect, and more and more voters
19	become aware that an election is occurring
20	as you approach Election Day. But the
21	advantage to early voting as a way of

- accelerating interest is that it happens not
- 23 through television, although there would be
- 24 media information, but it happens through

1	in-person contact. It's people going to
2	vote early, a week early let's say, who then
3	talk to their family members, to their
4	neighbors, their friends, to their
5	coworkers, "Hey, I voted yesterday," and
6	it's that direct as Professor Reeher
7	pointed out, it's person-to-person contact,
8	is the most powerful, that has the most
9	powerful impact on the attitudes of others
10	and the political attitudes of others and
11	the political awareness of others. And it's
12	precisely because early voting involves feet
13	going to the polls that there's every good
14	reason to believe that it will accelerate
15	interest in the final couple weeks leading
16	up to election day.
17	SENATOR GRIFFO: Could that be
18	accomplished if we were looking at the
19	no-excuse absentee balloting which would
20	allow people to still cast that ballot
21	earlier but also then to continue to ensure

- that people go to the polls on Election Day
- 23 to try to create that environment that Dr.
- Reeher discussed?

1	DR. SPITZER:	It could, except t	for
---	--------------	--------------------	-----

- 2 one thing, which is absentee voting is a
- 3 private act, in-person voting is a public
- 4 act. And I think that distinction would
- 5 give a little more weight to the beneficial
- 6 public consequences of allowing in-person
- 7 early voting, although I certainly agree
- 8 that loosening extraneous restrictions
- 9 regarding absentee voting would be
- beneficial as well.
- 11 SENATOR GRIFFO: Thanks. Senator
- 12 Valesky.
- 13 SENATOR VALESKY: Thank you, Mr.
- 14 Chairman. Professor Spitzer, thank you for
- 15 your testimony.
- DR. SPITZER: Thank you.
- 17 SENATOR ADDABBO: We have questions.
- DR. SPITZER: Oh, I'm sorry.
- 19 SENATOR VALESKY: Yeah. It's not a
- question. Maybe it's a comment.
- In regard to early voting, I noticed

- your experience certainly in Indiana and
- often the experience we read about and hear
- about in regard to other states often

1	centers around a presidential election.
2	Obviously that only happens once every four
3	years and I can't imagine a system where we
4	would have a bifurcated laws, one for
5	presidential election years and one in the
6	intervening three years. I would be
7	interested in any data that you may have in
8	regard to the experience with early voting
9	in other states in non-presidential years,
10	and particularly how that has affected
11	turnout, if it has at all. I know we always
12	tend to focus on presidential elections, but
13	that's
14	DR. SPITZER: Yes. There should be
15	available data on congressional midterm
16	election year turnout rates, and I will
17	pursue that and get back to your office.
18	SENATOR VALESKY: Thank you.
19	SENATOR ADDABBO: Mr. Spitzer, Mr.
20	Kendrick, thank you so much for being here
21	and for your efforts in the SUNY system. I

- 22 appreciate that as well. Thank you very
- 23 much.
- DR. SPITZER: Thank you for that.

1	SENATOR ADDABBO: I want to thank
2	Senator Griffo, a member of the elections
3	committee, for being here today. Thank you,
4	Senator Griffo.
5	And our last panel, panel of two, Mike
6	Atkins, Executive Director of Concerned
7	Citizens Action Program, and Carolyn Todd,
8	New Yorkers for Verified Voting.
9	(Whereupon Senator Griffo excused
10	himself from the hearing.)
11	MR. ATKINS: I have one other
12	gentlemen that's going to be with us. This
13	is Bishop Molefe.
14	SENATOR ADDABBO: Okay. So you want
15	Miss Todd to speak first and I'll call you
16	up as the last panel? How's that?
17	MR. ATKINS: Excellent.
18	SENATOR ADDABBO: Fair enough.
19	MR. ATKINS: He's from South Africa
20	so this system is kind of new to him
21	SENATOR ADDABBO: Okay.

- MR. ATKINS: -- so if he could sit
- right here and ...
- 24 SENATOR ADDABBO: Is he going to give

1	testimony or no?
2	MR. ATKINS: Yes, he's just going to
3	give testimony.
4	SENATOR ADDABBO: Okay. Miss Todd,
5	why don't you sit up front here and these
6	gentlemen will be the last panel.
7	MS. TODD: Do you want me to go
8	first?
9	SENATOR ADDABBO: Sure.
10	CAROLYN TODD
11	Election Inspector in Madison County
12	Member of New Yorkers for Verified Voting
13	MS. TODD: Senators Addabbo and
14	Valesky, good morning. My name is Carolyn
15	Todd. I reside in Hamilton, New York. I'm
16	an Election Inspector in Madison County, and
17	I'm also a member of New Yorkers for
18	Verified Voting and I'm very interested in
19	the integrity of elections.
20	I would like to speak today in favor of
21	Bills S5028 and 2868-A as they relate to the

- use of absentee ballots. I would like to
- present three reasons for supporting these
- bills.

1	First, the onus is on the voter to
2	state the exact nature of one's absence on
3	Election Day, but the authority to accept
4	the application rests with the County Board
5	of Elections. Will a voter be out of town
6	due to business obligations?
7	Will a last-minute business trip arise?
8	Will an illness of a senior citizen cause
9	the voter to be housebound on Election Day?
10	If a business trip or an illness should
11	occur after the seven-day deadline required
12	to postmark the application prior to the
13	election, then the voter is confronted with
14	a problem. The application needs to be hand
15	delivered to the County Board of Elections,
16	at great expense if Federal Express or
17	overnight mail is used. Personally driving
18	the application to the Board of Elections
19	appears to be an option.
20	In the case of voters who reside in a
21	rural county, such as my own county of

- Madison, a 34-mile round-trip drive must be
- 23 made to deliver the application. These
- last-minute crises can be avoided if voters

1	are permitted to choose a no-excuse absente
2	ballot.
3	Second, the voter needs to divulge
4	one's location on Election Day and dates of
5	one's absence. Why is this necessary? Are
6	the rights of voters protected when they are
7	asked to document the place where they
8	expect to be on Election Day? Who will be
9	responsible for protecting this sort of
10	private information, information that
11	reveals when one's home will be vacant and
12	for the periods of time involved.
13	Third, the quality of time required by
14	candidates and their attorneys and the time
15	required by paid election officials at the
16	local and state levels challenging and
17	defending these absentee ballots results in
18	a very costly procedure. Government
19	resources need to be used to serve people
20	with real problems, not spent arguing the
21	technicalities of every absentee ballot in

- 22 an election. Challenging the absentee
- ballot of Senator Kirsten Gillibrand in the
- 24 Congressional District 20 special election

1	this spring does not further the cause of
2	election trustworthiness and accuracy.
3	In conclusion, shrinking budgets and
4	common sense on both the public and private
5	side of the election equation demand that
6	reason prevail. No-excuse absentee ballots
7	need to be made legal in New York State.
8	And if I could just make one other
9	comment about one of the other pieces of
10	legislation, which is S2443, pertaining to
11	the assistance of voters when they arrive at
12	the wrong polling place, and I've heard a
13	couple of comments made this morning about
14	sort of beefing up the polling place, with
15	more equipment, laptops, sounds like
16	instantaneous map production, GPS
17	equipment's going to be required and really
18	sort of institutionalizing a real heavy-duty
19	polling place, I would suggest that the
20	system we have in Madison County is
21	wonderful. We just call the Board of

- Elections and ask: Here's the voter, where
- should she vote.
- I know that having cell. phones, asking

1	election hispectors to have cent, phones is
2	a concern, and so I would suggest for a \$10
3	Tracphone or \$20 Tracphone provided to each
4	polling place. The communication is then
5	allowed and encouraged from the poll site to
6	the Board of Elections and with one or two
7	phone calls the voter can be assisted and
8	directions can be given, and I would say
9	that trying to get elections inspectors to
10	utilize laptops and maps and directions on a
11	laptop is just too much. So that's my
12	thought on that one.
13	SENATOR ADDABBO: Thank you, Miss
14	Todd.
15	Mr. Atkins.
16	MIKE ATKINS
17	Executive Director
18	Concerned Citizens Action Program
19	MR. ATKINS: Thank you, Senator
20	Addabbo and to our great senator here in
21	Central New York. My name is Mike Atkins.

- I'm a former city councilman with the
- 23 City of Syracuse and also a former city
- chair in the City of Syracuse.

1	And as you heard earlier, a gentleman
2	spoke about the fourth district. That's the
3	district that at one time I represented,
4	which, when he spoke of the numbers of
5	individuals that are not truly represented
6	in there as far the voting process, that has
7	always been a challenge for that district.
8	I'm here today well, I'd like to
9	thank you, first of all, for this panel
10	discussion, because this is a very important
11	issue. And I'd also like to thank Senator
12	Malcolm Smith for hosting these types of
13	panels throughout New York State.
14	But when you talk about the voting
15	participation, when you look at the
16	democracy of our country and the importance
17	of people engaging, it's crucial. Today I
18	have a visitor that's here with me from
19	South Africa, Bishop Phillip Molefe, and he
20	is one of the pioneers that was with Nelson
21	Mandela in South Africa during their

- apartheid, and I thought it was very fitting
- for him to come today to see democracy at
- work here in the United States and right

1	nere in our great State of New York and in
2	the City of Syracuse. And I had wanted him
3	to just share with you something that he has
4	witnessed and just recently through the
5	election of the new president, Joseph Zuma,
6	and the lines of people that stood in line
7	over five hours that had walked miles just
8	to engage in a voting process. We talk
9	about access to polls. These individuals
10	walked miles and stood in line in 110
11	degrees of heat to participate. And I think
12	the key is how do we begin to get all
13	citizens to truly understand the passion and
14	the importance of voting and for their
15	rights. So I yield my time and I would just
16	like the Bishop just for a few minutes.
17	SENATOR ADDABBO: Please, Bishop
18	Molefe.
19	BISHOP MOLEFE
20	BISHOP MOLEFE: Good afternoon to all
21	the Senators here today.

- I thank Mike for inviting me for this
- special and interesting occasion.
- Voting is my interest in South Africa.

1	And here I think I have a cutting here,
2	which I brought along to show the importance
3	of voting in South Africa.
4	In South Africa, voting is a priority
5	for all the citizens of South Africa. We
6	wake up eight hours even before sunrise to
7	go to the polls to cast our votes. And this
8	morning I think it is my pleasure to be in a
9	gathering like this. I didn't know that I
10	would have an opportunity of sharing my
11	interest when it comes to voting, but I
12	think the cutting that I have here will say
13	it all. Can I hand it over?
14	SENATOR ADDABBO: Please.
15	MR. ATKINS: Again, Senator, I'd like
16	to thank you for giving us this opportunity
17	and especially for allowing the bishop to
18	say a few words on behalf of South Africa.
19	SENATOR ADDABBO: Well, Mr. Atkins, l
20	am pleased that the Bishop is here and that

basically he is part of our -- the last

- panel to highlight the importance of our
- democracy, not only throughout the state but
- throughout the country, so it is fitting,

1	Bisnop Moiere, that you're here and thank
2	you very much for being here and again
3	capping off what to me is a very
4	constructive and productive hearing. So
5	thank you very much.
6	Mr. Atkins, you brought up the fourth
7	ward, and we heard from Mr. Pierce-El
8	earlier
9	MR. ATKINS: Yes.
10	SENATOR ADDABBO: about the
11	numbers, unfortunately, but the need to
12	motivate our younger voters, which I think
13	is very important. We heard from, I
14	believe, Dr. Reeher earlier about the need
15	for civic involvement and I think that's a
16	great theme that we need to promote in our
17	election system, the need to encourage not
18	only young voters but the voter population
19	in general to instill upon them the great
20	need to vote and the basic patriotism that
21	is involved in voting. And I think this is

- something that the elections committee wants
- 23 to look into deeper. So I appreciate your
- testimony as well. And, Bishop, I wish you

1	a safe trip back to South Africa.
2	BISHOP MOLEFE: Thank you.
3	SENATOR ADDABBO: Thank you very
4	much. Ladies and gentlemen, I thank you all
5	for being a participant in this very
6	constructive hearing as we go forward not
7	only improving and expanding the voting
8	process and registration to voter
9	participation but protecting the checks and
10	balances that are there, protecting the
11	integrity and the accuracy of our voting
12	system. We don't want to dilute that in any
13	way, so we need to obviously protect that in
14	the same way and try and promote the
15	increased voter participation.
16	I want all to know the upcoming
17	hearings that the elections committee is
18	having on May 28th and on June 3rd. May
19	28th will be in Rochester. On June 3rd will
20	be in Albany. The topic there will be
21	campaign finance reform. And in September,

- a specific date to be determined, we would
- be talking about Board of Elections
- oversight, and in November we will be

1	talking about elections oversight in
2	general.
3	Again, the purpose of these hearings is
4	to open up the process, to be more
5	transparent, to be more inclusive of the
6	people who this affects on a pretty much
7	a daily basis.
8	So we appreciate your participation
9	here today, and I will take the bad weather
10	back home with me so don't worry to the good
11	people of Syracuse. Thanks for allowing us
12	to be here today, and thank you very much,
13	everybody. Have a great day. Thank you,
14	Senator Valesky. Thank you very much.
15	Written Statement Submitted by:
16	ROSS GALIN
17	Election Protection
18	
19	Chairman Addabbo, members of the New
20	York Senate Standing Committee on Elections,
21	thank you for inviting me to provide this

- statement on behalf of Election Protection
- in support of what we believe are important
- legislative initiatives.

1	Moreover, we thank you for holding this
2	and other hearings on how we can best
3	modernize New York State's election system
4	and address the deficiencies we all know
5	currently exist.
6	As you know, Election Protection is led
7	by the Lawyers' Committee for Civil Rights
8	Under Law and is supported by a diverse
9	network of local and national coalition
10	partners and over 10,000 legal volunteers
11	across the country.
12	The cornerstone of Election
13	Protection's work is our 866-OUR-VOTE voter
14	services hotline. Last year, over 240,000
15	voters, including 17,000 New Yorkers, called
16	the hotline seeking assistance with a
17	variety of election-related problems.
18	Additionally, tens of thousands more
19	received assistance from our teams of mobile
20	legal volunteers who were stationed
21	throughout New York City on Election Day

- this past November to help voters at
- targeted poll sites.
- In certain respects the 2008 election

1	was a success in New York State. A record
2	number of New Yorkers turned out at the
3	polls, and the vast majority were able to
4	vote without incident. The election was
5	not, however, without what have become
6	expected problems. Prevalent among them
7	were long lines at polling places, machine
8	breakdowns and registration issues. We
9	believe that each of the bills being
10	considered by this committee today are
11	important and each would improve New York's
12	election system and go a long way towards
13	addressing many of these problems that we
14	witnessed. There are two in particular that
15	we think are necessary to bring New York's
16	election system into the 21st century.
17	Those are S3250, the "Early Voting Act," and
18	S5028 to allow for "no-excuse" absentee
19	voting.
20	The work and family demands of modern
21	society do not always allow voters the time

- required to vote on a single Election Day.
- 23 Requiring nearly all voters to cast a ballot
- on a single day restricts the ability of

1	many to participate in our democracy. More
2	than one-third of registered voters who do
3	not vote attribute their inaction to being
4	out of town, away from home, too busy, or
5	having conflicting obligations on Election
6	Day.
7	Other Americans complain of
8	transportation problems or inconvenient
9	polling place locations. Early voting, as
10	would be permitted under S3250, would allow
11	much greater flexibility and significantly
12	alleviate these concerns, thereby increasing
13	turnout.
14	Not only does early voting increase
15	turnout, but it also alleviates many of the
16	problems that lead to mass
17	disenfranchisement on Election Day.
18	Spreading out the burden of Election Day
19	over a period of two weeks, as called for in
20	this legislation, would provide election
21	officials with the opportunity to recognize

- and solve the problems that plague elections
- prior to the time when most voters go to the
- polls, and in a manner that would lessen the

1	risk that voters would be disenfranchised.
2	As hard as election officials try, and
3	we recognize that they try hard, not every
4	problem that emerges on Election Day can be
5	solved quickly enough to prevent some voters
6	from effectively being disenfranchised.
7	Election Protection has found in its work
8	throughout the country that states that had
9	early voting fared better than those that
10	did not in overcoming some of the most
11	pressing problems of this election season,
12	including inadequate preparation by election
13	officials and poll workers for the increased
14	turnout, malfunctioning machines, shortages
15	of paper ballots and long lines.
16	Our experience with Election Protection
17	helps to illustrate just why New York needs
18	to implement early voting. Mary T., a
19	Manhattan voter, called our 866-OUR-VOTE
20	hotline at 8:40 a.m. on Election Day to
21	report that she had been waiting in line at

- her polling place since 6:00 a.m. She
- reported that there were still several
- hundred people ahead of her in line. Mary

1	said that people were becoming trustrated
2	and leaving without voting. Mary expressed
3	concern that she too would not be able to
4	wait out the long line. In part, the delay
5	at Mary's polling place was due to a broken
6	machine.
7	An early voting period would not
8	prevent machine breakdowns, but it would
9	mitigate the damage caused when one does go
10	down, and, at the very least, an early
11	voting period would significantly shorten
12	the long lines at polls. According to Dr.
13	Michael McDonald, a professor at George
14	Mason University's Department of Public And
15	International affairs, approximately 30
16	percent of all ballots cast in the
17	presidential election of 2008 were cast
18	prior to Election Day. Of those
19	approximately 39.7 million ballots, 94
20	percent were cast in the 34 states with some
21	form of no-excuse early voting. In North

- Carolina, the state's adoption for 2008 of
- an early voting process lead to the state's
- highest voter turnout in 24 years. Nearly

1	nail the ballots cast for president were
2	cast prior to Election Day. In Georgia,
3	one-third of voters took advantage of early
4	voting.
5	In Florida, 4 million people voted
6	early. A fact that should not be lost among
7	these numbers is that New York is one of
8	only 16 states that does not have some form
9	of no-excuse early voting, and, in that
10	respect, lags behind states like North
11	Carolina, Georgia and Florida.
12	Mark S. of Syracuse called to report
13	that the sole machine at his voting site had
14	broken. Mark informed Election Protection
15	that, to their credit, the poll workers had
16	properly told voters that they could cast
17	emergency paper ballots. Many voters,
18	however, did not feel comfortable casting
19	paper ballots. One of the important aspects
20	of the S3250 is that it provides for early
21	voting on machines, just as on Election Day.

- This would allow those voters who, whether
- justified or not, do not trust paper ballots
- 24 the option to guarantee voting on a machine

1	by voting during the early period. If a
2	machine is down during the early period,
3	voters can return on another day when the
4	machine has either been fix or replaced,
5	rather than vote by paper ballot.
6	For some voters, the health of the
7	machines presents less of an obstacle than
8	does their own health. Janet H. of
9	Whitestone called our hotline in advance of
10	Election Day hoping to learn that she could
11	vote early. Janet explained that she is an
12	older woman and some days she feels better
13	and has more strength than other days. She
14	hoped, therefore, that she could vote on a
15	day that she felt well and strong, rather
16	than risk that she would feel that way on
17	Election Day. S3250 would offer Janet and
18	others like her that opportunity.
19	S5028 is an important counterpart to
20	the early voting period provided for in
21	S3250. In the weeks leading up to this past

- Election Day, the offices of New York's
- Boards of Election reported overflow crowds
- of voters seeking absentee ballots.

1	Unfortunately for many of those who waited
2	in those lines, their votes were susceptible
3	to challenge based on the supposed adequacy
4	of their reasons for voting by absentee
5	ballots. For example, had Janet H. voted by
6	absentee ballot, her health issues would
7	make her ballot susceptible to challenge and
8	her vote not assured of being counted.
9	S5028 would remove that risk.
10	The restrictions placed on the ability
11	of New Yorkers to vote by absentee ballot
12	are arbitrary and result in uneven
13	application. If the purpose of absentee
14	voting is to allow those who are unable to
15	vote in person to exercise their right to
16	vote, restricting its use as a New York law
17	currently does is counterproductive. Our
18	laws should be designed to foster
19	participation, not restrict it.
20	Again, thank you for the opportunity to
21	submit this statement, and, more

- 22 importantly, for continuing to examine how
- New York's election laws can be improved.
- Written Statement Submitted by:

1	LYNNE M. JONES and
2	LAURA P. COSTELLO
3	Election Commissioners of Madison County
4	Board of Elections
5	
6	We are submitting written testimony on
7	the bills proposed by the NYS Senate
8	Committee on Elections.
9	We do not wish to speak at the hearing,
10	but ask that our written testimony be
11	considered and made part of the hearing
12	record.
13	We submit our statements jointly, and
14	would like to stress the importance of
15	passing S5028 (no-excuse absentee) and
16	S1386-A (half-day shifts for inspectors).
17	Thank you. I would like to submit the
18	following written testimony regarding two of
19	the senate bills that are on the agenda for
20	the public hearing.
21	S5028, which amends the Constitution to

- 22 allow no-excuse absentee voting by removing
- the restrictions on a voter's right to vote
- by absentee voting.

1	Many election commissioners have been
2	requesting that the no-excuse absentee
3	voting issue be submitted to the State
4	Legislature through the Legislative
5	Committee of the Election Commissioners
6	Association for many years. One of the main
7	reasons this is a good idea is we have been
8	hearing from voters that, with the new
9	voting system being implemented, they are no
10	longer going to vote. They do not want to
11	vote on the new machines. Many of them are
12	nervous about trying the new machines. When
13	we tell them it will be okay, they still say
14	they will no longer vote. They also ask why
15	it is so hard to get an absentee ballot.
16	Our only option right now is to tell them to
17	leave the county before the polls open and
18	not to return until after the polls close.
19	This is not an option for many of them, so
20	they will choose not to vote.
21	I also believe voter turnout would be

- better because many people do not want to go
- 23 to the poll site to vote. They would rather
- do so in the privacy of their own home. It

1	would increase voter turnout.
2	If the absentee process was changed to
3	allow no-excuse voting, there are procedures
4	that are followed before absentees are
5	opened and counted so that a person could
6	not vote in person and also vote an absentee
7	ballot. All absentee ballots are checked
8	against the poll books after Election Day,
9	so there is no way they could vote by
10	absentee and in person. This is an
11	excellent bill and is long overdue. I
12	sincerely hope that this bill is passed and
13	that Section 2 of Article 2 of the
14	Constitution is amended.
15	S2868-A - eliminates the requirement
16	that voters who request an absentee ballot
17	disclose private and personal information
18	about why they cannot vote at their polling
19	station.
20	This bill should be supported for a
21	number of reasons. Most of the information

- that is received in the County Board of
- Elections' office falls under the Freedom of
- Information Law and can be viewed by someone

1	who files a FOIL request. This means that				
2	the private and personal information that				
3	has been entered on the absentee application				
4	can be viewed by others. The information				
5	can be viewed by attorneys who have				
6	impounded an election. Under an impoundment				
7	order, we were required to fax absentee				
8	applications to attorneys. Anyone could				
9	have had access to the information on those				
10	applications.				
11	Anyone who works in our office also				
12	sees this information. We do not need to				
13	know the extent of a person's personal				
14	information. As long as we have the				
15	pertinent information to issue the absentee				
16	ballot, that is all the information we need.				
17	We do not need medical history. If they				
18	state that they cannot appear at the polling				
19	place, we can take that on good faith.				
20	If a person is on vacation, education				
21	outside the county, working outside the				

- county, we do not need to know the details
- of each of those. We have enough
- information if we know that they will be

1	absent from the county, the dates they will				
2	be gone (if they require ballots for more				
3	than one election) and a mailing address,				
4	along with other identifying information				
5	that is required (name, date of birth, and				
6	county residence).				
7	This bill would also help streamline				
8	the absentee application. Many times we				
9	cannot send an absentee ballot because some				
10	of the information is missing and we cannot				
11	reach the voter to get information that we				
12	do not feel is needed, but is required by				
13	Election Law at this time.				
14	Thank you for taking the time to read				
15	and consider my written testimony on these				
16	two important bills. Sincerely, Lynne M.				
17	Jones, Election Commissioner, Madison County				
18	Board of Elections.				
19	(The following is a continuation of				
20	the written statement submitted by Lynne				
21	M. Jones and Laura P. Costello, Election				

- 22 Commissioners Madison County Board of
- Elections.)
- 24 As election commissioners, we

1	appreciate the need to get more people
2	voting. We are not a true democracy when a
3	registered few can decide who will govern
4	our towns and cities, states and nation.
5	Many of the bills we are reviewing are meant
6	to increase voter turnout by making the
7	process of registering and voting more
8	convenient.
9	No-excuse absentee voting (S5028) and
10	same-day registration (S1616) both greatly
11	increase the access to the election process
12	and require a Constitutional Amendment.
13	This means that if the bills are passed this
14	year we will still have several years to get
15	comfortable with the new paper ballot voting
16	system before implementing these new
17	registration and absentee procedures. Both
18	these bills should be passed.
19	Early voting (S3250) would alleviate
20	the absentee voting process, but the bill
21	would be effective January of next year

- The first federal election year using a new
- voting system is not the time to introduce
- 24 new early voting procedures. This bill

1	would serve us better in another year.				
2	The remaining bills being reviewed				
3	today apply to actual election procedures.				
4	We agree that: S1058-A, polling places				
5	should be accessible; S1701, affidavits				
6	should be counted even if voted in the wrong				
7	election district (only counting the votes				
8	that apply to the correct district); S5112,				
9	paper ballots should contain a box to mark				
10	that any "undervotes" are intentional.				
11	To require that the inspectors get the				
12	voter to the correct poll site (S2443) may				
13	be overambitious. Inspectors have street				
14	lists, poll site lists, and district maps.				
15	But if the voter is not registered, not in				
16	the primary party or wrongly districted, he				
17	may be sent to several poll sites by				
18	well-meaning inspectors. We recommend that				
19	the inspectors call our office where we can				
20	research the registration and determine why				
21	the voter is at the wrong poll site.				

- Allowing ballots cast in the wrong poll site
- to be counted would be more effective than
- 24 expecting the inspectors to direct voters to

1	the correct poll site with maps and lists.
2	We need to allow inspectors to split
3	shifts on Election Day (S1386-A). General
4	Election day for inspectors can last from
5	5:30 a.m. to after 10:00 p.m. Even a
6	half-day shift would be eight hours. As
7	senators, you must know what a 16-hour day
8	is like. We are asking thousands of
9	inspectors to work these long hours and then
10	end the day with the highly accountable job
11	of closing down the polls, sealing the
12	voting machines and ballots, and canvassing
13	the results. We have procedures in place,
14	oaths taken, affidavits filed that can
15	guarantee the integrity of an election
16	without requiring all of our inspectors to
17	work 16 plus hours and then canvass the
18	election results.
19	Thank you for this opportunity to
20	comment on the proposed laws and
21	regulations.

- Written Statement Submitted by:
- 23 CHARLOTTE (CHUCKIE) HOLSTEIN
- 24 Executive Director of FOCUS

1	"Forging Our Community's United Strength"
2	
3	THE WHITE HOUSE For Immediate Release
4	January 21, 2009 MEMORANDUM FOR THE HEADS OF
5	EXECUTIVE DEPARTMENTS AND my Administration
6	is committed to creating an unprecedented
7	level of openness in Government. We will
8	work together to ensure the public trust and
9	establish a system of transparency, public
10	participation, and collaboration.
11	Openness will strengthen our democracy
12	and promote efficiency and effectiveness in
13	Government.
14	Government should be transparent.
15	Transparency promotes accountability and
16	provides information for citizens about what
17	their Government is doing. Information
18	maintained by the federal Government is a
19	national asset. My Administration will take
20	appropriate action, consistent with law and
21	policy to disclose information rapidly in

- forms that the public can readily find and
- use. Executive departments and agencies
- should harness new technologies to put

1	information about their operations and				
2	decisions on-line and readily available to				
3	the public. Executive departments and				
4	agencies should also solicit public feedback				
5	to identify information of greatest use to				
6	the public.				
7	Government should be participatory.				
8	Public engagement enhances the Government's				
9	effectiveness and improves the quality of				
10	its decisions. Knowledge is widely				
11	disbursed in society, and public officials				
12	benefit from having access to that disbursed				
13	knowledge. Executive departments and				
14	agencies should offer Americans increased				
15	opportunities to participate in policymaking				
16	and to provide their Government with the				
17	benefits of their collective expertise and				
18	information. Executive departments and				
19	agencies should also solicit public input on				
20	how we can increase and improve				
21	opportunities for public participation in				

- Government.
- Government should be collaborative.
- 24 Collaboration actively engages Americans in

1	the work of their Government. Executive				
2	departments and agencies should use				
3	innovative tools, methods, and systems to				
4	cooperate among themselves, across all				
5	levels of Government, and with nonprofit				
6	organizations, businesses, and individuals				
7	in the private sector. Executive				
8	departments and agencies should solicit				
9	public feedback to assess and improve their				
10	level of collaboration and to identify new				
11	opportunities for cooperation.				
12	I direct the Chief Technology Officer,				
13	in coordination with the Director of the				
14	Office of Management and Budget (OMB) and				
15	the Administrator of General Services, to				
16	coordinate the development by appropriate				
17	executive departments and agencies, within				
18	120 days, of recommendations for an Open				
19	Government Directive, to be issued by the				
20	Director of OMB, that instructs executive				
21	departments and agencies to take specific				

- 22 actions implementing the principles set
- forth in this memorandum. The independent
- agencies should comply with the Open

1	Government Directive.				
2	This memorandum is not intended to, and				
3	does not, create any right or benefit,				
4	substantive or procedural, enforceable at				
5	law or in equity by a party against the				
6	United States, its departments, agencies, or				
7	entities, its officers, employees, or				
8	agents, or any other person.				
9	This memorandum shall be published in				
10	the Federal Register.				
11	Barack Obama. * * *				
12					
13					
14					
15					
16					
17					
18					
19					
20					
21					